



City and County of San Francisco
Department of Human Resources
James P. Horan, Acting Director

Workforce and Succession Planning Report

May 2007



May 18, 2007

I am pleased to present the Department of Human Resources' (DHR) 2007 Workforce and Succession Planning Report (WSP Report).

Many studies confirm that the U.S. is approaching a crisis in the workforce with two demographic trends – the growing number of Baby Boomers in the general population, and the much smaller number of younger people who follow behind them. Due to a number of factors as described in the WSP Report, the government sector is the first to feel the effects of these demographic shifts. Statistics reflect that over 60% of the government's workforce (federal, state and local) will be eligible to retire within the next ten years. However, this is an issue that we must begin to address now.

The WSP Report can be a resource tool for departments in developing workforce and succession plans. It describes a workforce and succession planning outline that departments may use to design their own programs. In addition, it provides a description of the roles and responsibilities of DHR, individual departments, and policymakers in these efforts. The WSP Report also provides background on some of the City's workforce and succession planning efforts to date, along with a preliminary assessment of research on retirement eligibility. Lastly, the WSP Report highlights some examples of workforce and succession planning strategies utilized in other jurisdictions.

DHR looks forward to working with departments on their workforce and succession planning efforts. I hope you find this document useful and informative, and we look forward to any feedback and comments you may have.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "James P. Horan".

James P. Horan
Acting Human Resources Director

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

1	Purpose.....	5
2	Overview.....	6
2.1	Workforce Planning.....	6
2.2	Succession Planning.....	6
2.3	Rationale for Workforce and Succession Planning.....	6
2.4	Roles in Workforce and Succession Planning.....	9
2.5	Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning.....	9
3	History of City Workforce & Succession Planning Efforts.....	10
4	Elements of Successful WSP Programs.....	12
5	Preliminary Findings on City WSP Readiness and Needs.....	13

Appendices

Appendix A. Citywide Workforce Data	A-1
Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning	B-1
Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions	C-1
Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses	D-1
Appendix E. Sample Memo	E-1
Appendix F. Sample Analysis	F-1
Appendix G. Sources	G-1

Executive Summary

This document is organized into two sections:

1. A brief report presenting key concepts in workforce and succession planning (WSP) and summarizing our research on successful WSP programs, occupational shifts, and a preliminary analysis of workforce planning needs among 16 City employee groups.
2. Appendices containing detailed data and analyses of workforce data both Citywide and among targeted employee groups, detailed WSP program implementation steps, and a discussion of strategies implemented in other jurisdictions.

1 Purpose

In May 2005 the Department of Human Resources (DHR) published its Civil Service Reform report to review the City's human resources systems and offer recommendations for improvement. In October 2006 DHR published its first Workforce Analysis to provide an update to data presented in May 2005 as well as additional workforce data to inform project implementation in a number of areas, particularly succession planning. Both reports highlighted the City's need to address workforce and succession planning (WSP) in a more comprehensive way, which this Workforce and Succession Planning report is intended to do.

This report has several purposes:

- Emphasize that WSP is an essential strategy for the City to implement if the City is to provide services in the years ahead. Research of WSP programs in other organizations shows that in order to be successful, workforce and succession planning efforts must be supported by the City's leaders. This report will lay the groundwork for that commitment.
- Describe the roles and responsibilities of DHR, departments, and policymakers in WSP.
- Describe the City's WSP efforts to date and provide a preliminary assessment of our retirement eligibility and WSP efforts among 16 departments and employee groups.
- Provide the results of our review of WSP strategies used in other jurisdictions, including a WSP program outline that City departments may use to design their own programs.

2 Overview

2.1 Workforce Planning

Workforce planning refers to the efforts organizations make to ensure they have the ability, through their staff, to meet current and emerging service needs. The goal of workforce planning is to have the right skills in the right place at the right time to deliver these services. The basic model of workforce planning has four components: assess future service needs, assess future supply of personnel able to deliver those services, identify the gaps between need and supply, and develop a plan for closing the gap. Plans may then be implemented at all stages of the employment life cycle: recruitment and selection, performance management, compensation and benefits, training and development, leadership development, career management, retention, and retirement.

2.2 Succession Planning

Succession planning is a type of workforce planning that focuses more narrowly on hiring and preparing staff to fill expected vacancies, most typically at the senior management and executive levels. Common succession planning strategies include leadership development among promising mid-level employees as well as programs to document, or teach through mentoring, the accumulated knowledge and expertise of departing staff.

2.3 Rationale for Workforce and Succession Planning

Government Will Experience Demographic Changes First

Studies showing that government is one of the first sectors to feel the effects of an aging national workforce cite several factors contributing to this trend, including: increased hiring in the late 1960s and 1970s; downsizing in the late 1980s and early 1990s; institution of early retirement programs, which encouraged the most seasoned employees to leave the workforce; declining appeal of public service; human resources practices and policies that handicap the government from competing with the private sector; retirement programs that allow employees to retire earlier than typical private-sector policies; inflexible retirement policies that don't allow phased retirements; and reductions in training and development budgets which result in an inadequate pipeline of younger workers to replace older workers as they retire.¹

Effect of Increasing Retirements

Interest in workforce and succession planning among government agencies has increased in the past decade, prompted largely by predictions of a massive wave of retirements of Baby Boom generation employees. The average age of public sector workers is older than that of private sector workers, and a considerable proportion of employees at all levels of government are at or close to reaching retirement eligibility.² These demographic trends will certainly require

¹ The Aging-and-Retiring Government Workforce: How Serious is the Challenge? What are Jurisdictions Doing About it? 2003. The Center for Organizational Research.

² Ibid.

governments to hire and train a large number of new workers to maintain their operations and replace the valuable knowledge and experience lost with certain retirements.

Currently, approximately 18% of the City and County workforce, or nearly one in every five employees, is eligible to elect a service retirement. San Francisco is similar to other organizations in this respect; in a recent IPMA-HR survey of 350 public sector professionals on the impact of the aging workforce on their organizations, 69% of respondents reported that fewer than 25% of their employees is currently eligible for retirement. Another 26% of respondents reported that 26-50% is currently retirement eligible.³ See Appendix A. Citywide Workforce Data for detailed retirement eligibility data.

Experts disagree about the precise impact of an aging population on the workforce. Labor force participation rates for people aged 55 years and older have increased since the 1980s, and will continue to increase. The percentage of all workers 55 and older is projected to increase from 15.6% in 2004 to 21.2% in 2014.⁴ Overall, the median worker age will rise, proportionately fewer Americans will be in the workforce, and growth in the labor force will slow.⁵ Many Baby Boomers will defer retirement, either because they can not afford to or do not wish to stop working.⁶ These factors will dampen, but not eliminate, the effect of Boomer retirements. While the national shift toward defined contribution pension plans is commonly blamed for decreased financial security and increased workforce participation rates among workers aged 55-65,⁷ the City still provides a defined benefit pension, so its employees are more likely to be able to afford to retire.

Generational Differences in Work Styles and Preferences

Potential retirements are only part of the picture in the future workforce. Employers are beginning to understand they need to adapt to employees that will change jobs and careers more often than prior generations.⁸ For the first time, there are four distinct generations working side-by-side; the City and County is no exception. The differences among these groups, developed by experience and shared values, can affect everything from work ethic and the desire for work/life balance to communication and productivity. Managers will need to consider these differences in order to recruit quality staff and develop effective workforce succession planning strategies.

Below are attitudes of the four generations and how they affect career goals:

- Traditionalists/Maturers (born 1925-1942): Matures believe that doing a good job is the most important thing. They also believe that age is equal to seniority and that promotions come from that seniority. The company is always first with this generation, and it is not uncommon for Matures to stay in the same job with the same company for their entire working lives.

³ Davidson, Glen, et al. 2007. The Impact of the Aging Workforce on Public Sector Organizations and Mission. International Public Management Association for Human Resources. February.

⁴ Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2006-07 Edition. U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics.

⁵ Toossi, Mitra. 2005. Labor force projections to 2014: retiring boomers. *Monthly Labor Review*. United States Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics. November.

⁶ How to manage an ageing workforce. 2006. *The Economist*. February 18.

⁷ Anderson Garcia, Alissa. 2007. More Californians are Working Later in Life. *Policy Points*. California Budget Project. April.

⁸ McGonigle et al. 2006. Recommendations for Updating the City's Classification Plan, Interim Report. ICF Consulting. September 6.

- Boomers (born 1943-1960): Boomers define their work ethic by how many hours they put in at work. They invented the 50-plus hour work week to maximize their “face time” at work which they believe is vital to their success. They expect loyalty from those they work with.
- Generation Xers (born 1961-1981): They have developed the attitude that “this company never promised you anything.” They are the first generation that will financially not do as well as their parents. They respect production over tenure and look for a person to whom they can invest loyalty, not a company.
- Millennials/Generation Y/Nexters (born 1981-1999): They are ambitious, but not entirely focused. They look to the workplace for direction and to help them achieve their goals. They possess an especially high expectation for bosses and managers to assist and mentor them in attainment of their professional goals.⁹

Beyond Demographics: The Changing Nature of Work

Many employers have realized that beyond changing demographics, they need to adjust to the effect of changes in the nature of work in a postindustrial economy. In the past decade, work in both the public and private sectors has moved from being well-defined and task-oriented to quickly changing and knowledge-based. Organizations need employees who can adapt to changing technology and work environments, who can function effectively around team- and project-based work, and who possess complex skills such as relationship management and problem solving.

State of Public Sector Workforce and Succession Planning

Although the changing nature of work and aging population have become more broadly understood, many local government organizations have yet to introduce effective WSP measures. For example, one of the most basic and important statistics for organizations to track for WSP is turnover. Results of the IMPA-HR survey referenced above show that most organizations do not understand turnover dynamics in their current workforces. Even if they do monitor employee retirement eligibility, they find it difficult to predict actual retirements. They are also likely to focus too much on the aging workforce and not enough on other forces—changing citizen demographics and service needs, private sector competition for workers, challenges in keeping younger workers—that are equally important.

While HR departments are more likely to conduct strategic planning now than they were several years ago, they still do not collect adequate data on employee turnover or skills or incorporate such data into decisions about hiring or leadership development. Even organizations aware of the impact of retirements on service delivery are often not proactive in developing a response. Common reasons cited are a lack of resources, no explicit mandate from policymakers, and the tendency to rely on IT systems over planning and data collection to address workforce changes.

Fifty-one percent of respondents do not believe their organizations have sufficient talent to replace retiring workers, which suggests recruitment efforts will need to expand. Given

⁹ Stefaniak, Angie. 2007. Black Hole or Window of Opportunity? Understanding the Generation Gap in Today’s Workforce. Center for Public Policy and Administration. University of Utah. April.

constraints on compensation, more organizations are using or considering flexible scheduling, job sharing, and telecommuting to increase retention.¹⁰

2.4 Roles in Workforce and Succession Planning

Based on our research, we define the roles and responsibilities of DHR, departments, and policymakers in WSP below. All groups should involve employees and labor groups as needed.

Department of Human Resources

- Provide high-level turnover and retirement risk analyses using centrally-available Human Resources Information System (HRIS) data.
- Advise departments on WSP models.
- Advocate on behalf of all departments the need to address WSP issues.
- Coordinate Citywide or inter-departmental programs to address WSP issues, such as a citywide apprenticeship program and flexible scheduling policies.

City Departments

- Review and update the Department's mission, vision, and strategic plan.
- Follow the steps in the WSP model in section 2.5 below. Departments are the entities that must involve operational experts in WSP. Appendix B. Workforce and Succession Planning Model provides detailed roles and responsibilities for the development of WSP plans at the department level.
- Involve employees in the planning process.

Elected Officials

- Recognize WSP as an important citywide policy issue and fund efforts to address WSP both citywide and at the department level.
- Facilitate the implementation of citywide solutions that require legislative action.

2.5 Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

There are many WSP models being utilized, all with slight variations. There are however, several steps that exist in the majority of models. When approaching WSP, there is a tendency to make assumptions about the problem and turn immediately to developing solutions. However, organizations need both accurate data and a vision for the future before moving to the solutions phase of the process, or the solutions may be ineffective. Please see Appendix B. Workforce and Succession Planning Model for detailed information on WSP steps.

The following is a brief description of these 10 steps:

1. **Context**– The first issue to is to determine what affects WSP efforts. The department's vision, goals, and strategic plans can be utilized as a good starting point. Additionally, to facilitate this discussion, some organizations conduct a SWOT (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats) analysis.

¹⁰ Davidson et al.

2. **Scope**– The purpose of this step is to determine the nature and scale of WSP efforts. The scope should be focused, manageable, and set within a reasonable time period. It is often determined by the top management of the organization.
3. **Work**– Next, a determination must be made about what work will need to be done within the time period of the project, that is, if current tasks, activities, and functions will change in response to technology, legal mandates, and other external forces. It is important to focus on the functions that must be completed, rather than the people doing the work.
4. **Demand**– This next step will ascertain what staff will be needed to perform the functions as identified within the scope. An analysis will be made regarding competencies needed and the number of positions needed to accomplish the work.
5. **Supply**– The purpose of the next step is to identify what candidates will be available. Profile the current workforce and determine the supply, based upon the scope and needed competencies.
6. **Gap Analysis**– The gap analysis is crucial to determine what the needs will be by comparing the demand with the supply to determine the gaps that need to be addressed. This is a two-step process to identify where the candidates will come from and then determine the gaps between demand and supply.
7. **Priorities**– This step may be one of the most difficult to accomplish. The purpose is to look objectively, and determine which staffing gaps will have the most impact on the department’s ability to achieve its goals.
8. **Solutions**– The solutions step comes next—developing solutions to meet the staffing needs based upon the Priorities. Consider staff resources and other costs associated with addressing the issue.
9. **Success Measures**– Success measures are critical to establish before the implementation of any strategies begin. Success measures determine if the WSP strategy is working.
10. **Implement, Monitor, Evaluate & Improve**– This is a multi-step process and involves implementing the strategies, monitoring and evaluating the program and results, and where necessary, modifying the strategies. The WSP plan should be constantly reviewed and revised – as some issues are addressed, new issues may arise.

3 History of City Workforce & Succession Planning Efforts

Review of Management Positions - 2003

In June 2003 DHR published “Who Will Do San Francisco’s Work,” a report that discussed the impact of demographic changes in the workforce and how the City could ensure that departments have the human capital needed to provide essential services. The report was a technical

assistance guide for departments, providing definitions of workforce and succession planning concepts, workforce and succession planning models, a list of 24 job competencies for managers, and retirement projections by job class for management classifications. Lastly, the report provided information gathering tools that departments, working together with DHR, could use to determine areas of risk in City services and mission, and to identify strategies to meet those risks, specifically, a survey of management staff competencies that would need to be addressed in any succession planning program. Subsequent analysis of survey data and collaboration between DHR and departments on WSP for management positions did not occur due to changing priorities Citywide.

Civil Service Reform Report and Initial Implementation - 2005

In May 2005 DHR published “Civil Service Reform: Preserving the Promise of Government,” a report that looked at the City’s civil service and human resource systems and identified areas for change, including 46 recommendations across four key areas: hiring, employee investment/ performance management, separations, and governance. Currently, 31 of the 46 recommendations have been implemented or are in progress. The following programs and policy changes are already helping workforce and succession planning efforts Citywide:

- Implementation of position-based testing to reduce hiring times for many positions. DHR also helped reduce hiring times by modifying the requisition approval process to reduce the number of approvals needed by over a third and increase speed of approval by over 45%.
- An integrated, web-based application and referral system is in place to increase the quantity, and perhaps the quality, of applicants to City jobs.
- In August 2005, the Mayor directed all departments to conduct performance evaluations for all employees. DHR provides performance planning and appraisal training and collects Citywide data on completed appraisals.
- DHR designed and implemented a training program entitled 24-PLUS for all new managers and supervisors, negotiated increased tuition reimbursement funds through MOUs, and expanded the hours of training offered and delivered at DHR and through City University, a partnership with City College of San Francisco and San Francisco State University- College of Extended Learning.
- DHR is reviewing workforce data and trends and meeting with departments to discuss high risk areas, development programs, and WSP programs to prepare for possible loss of staff.

City University - 2006

In FY2006-07, DHR implemented City University (CU), whose goal is “to ensure San Francisco has a government workforce that is educated, trained and prepared to provide quality service to its citizens now and into the future.” CU offers both short-term skills training and longer-term development options that can help departments meet identified workforce planning needs.

To guide program development, DHR conducted a survey and held focus groups with employees and department representatives on training logistics, course content for employees, and career development opportunities. Results from survey participants showed the highest interest in classes for supervisory and management skills (i.e., performance management, conflict

management), people skills (i.e., public speaking, intercultural communication), and foundation skills (i.e., computer skills, writing skills). Responses from focus group participants showed great interest in training, but often a lack of information on training options; lack of encouragement or release time to attend training in the face of workload demands; and incorrect information from supervisors and managers on what kind of training can be reimbursed. Employees appear most interested in training that will help them earn promotions. Through the City's partnership with San Francisco State's College of Extended Learning and City College of San Francisco, the City is currently offering courses in project management, human resource management, professional communications, English for professional purposes, and a variety of writing, oral communications, computer classes. CU is establishing a Human Resources Certificate Pilot Program to prepare the City's personnel analysts for human resource management positions. The curriculum includes professional skills classes, City-specific human resources workshops and human resources generalist training. As the CU program develops there will be additional course offerings and increased customization of training to meet the needs of the City's workforce.

Workforce Analysis - 2006

Most recently, in October 2006, DHR published the FY2005-06 Workforce Analysis, which described demographic characteristics and trends of the City's workforce. The first comprehensive analysis of the City's workforce, it provides a picture of the City's current workforce, as well as retirement milestones and five-year trends on new hires, separations, and turnover rates by department for succession planning purposes. Key findings from this report are presented in Appendix A. Citywide Workforce Data, which also includes an analysis of more recent data in which sworn members of the Police and Fire departments are analyzed separately from miscellaneous staff.

4 Elements of Successful WSP Programs

Specific examples of workforce and succession planning efforts in other jurisdictions are presented in Appendix C. WSP Effort in Other Jurisdictions. Successful programs share the following elements:

Integrated Approach

Organizations must use accurate and meaningful data to identify needs, gathered by a team made of experts throughout the agency/division/unit. They must integrate workforce and succession planning with other processes, such as strategic planning and budgeting. Successful jurisdictions commit themselves to an action plan that includes all phases of employment, from hiring and training to career management and retirement.

Operational Involvement

“The most successful approaches to workforce planning engage managers at all levels of the organization, and are not just driven by HR.”¹¹ Workforce and succession planning must involve

¹¹ The Aging-and-Retiring Government Workforce. How Serious is the Challenge? What are Jurisdictions Doing About it? 2003. The Center for Organizational Research.

more than HR staff to be successful. In the model presented in Appendix B. Workforce and Succession Planning Model, WSP teams include managers at various levels of the department working in different areas of operations.

Suspend Assumptions to Reach Targeted Solutions

There is a natural inclination to consider solutions too early in the process. Avoid this by questioning commonly held assumptions. Without a comprehensive review to accurately identify problems, organizations risk implementing the wrong programs. It is more effective to have a targeted response to a specific, strategically important issue than a large scale, general response to the aging workforce.

Universal Success Factors

Regardless of the organization, department, or unit in which WSP occurs, successful programs include strategies which build organizational capacity. They:

- Receive active support of top leadership.
- Are linked to a strategic plan.
- Identify talent from multiple organizational levels, early in careers, or with critical skills.
- Emphasize developmental assignments in addition to formal training.
- Address specific human capital challenges, such as diversity, leadership capacity, and retention.¹²

Use Competencies

Competencies are combinations of knowledge, skills, abilities, and personal characteristics that can be used to describe a job, such as analytical ability or leadership. In the most successful programs, they serve as a common language among all HR functions and parts of the organization to discuss jobs and skills. DHR is currently developing a dictionary of core competencies based on ONET, the Occupational Information Network, which replaces the U.S. Department of Labor's Dictionary of Occupational Titles.

5 Preliminary Findings on City WSP Readiness and Needs

Based on the results of analyses of internal quantitative and qualitative data collected from various databases, surveys, and interviews with staff throughout the City, which are described in Appendix D, Selected Detailed Analyses, we identified the following trends and issues:

Operational Expertise is Required

Centrally-available data on employee demographics and retirement projections from the City's Human Resources Information System (HRIS) are useful in identifying high-level trends and retirement risk at the citywide and department levels, however, in the absence of operational expertise from departments, they are of limited use in identifying true risk at the job code level in ways that can lead to solutions. Detailed data about skills and training are not sufficiently captured in HRIS at this time to use in WSP.

¹² Human Capital: Insights for U.S. Agencies from Other Countries' Succession Planning and Management Initiatives. 2003. (GAO-03-914). Government Accountability Office.

Action Lags Behind Understanding

Both the City and its departments are like other employers in that they are increasingly aware of the importance of succession and workforce planning to their operations, but have not yet implemented programs to address their needs. Implementation persistently lags behind understanding. Most departments choose to address current over future problems, especially given budget processes and a political environment where it is difficult to sustain support for programs that take years to yield benefits.

One Size Does Not Fit All

Problems and solutions vary greatly among employee and skill groups. For some departments, high retirement risk among a group of employees is not a problem in itself; attrition may represent an opportunity to hire employees with the most current skills and service delivery approach needed to effectively serve the public. In these cases, the ability to quickly and effectively recruit and hire is more important than retention or knowledge management. In other cases, transferring knowledge of key individuals is the highest priority.

Balance in Recruitment

Departments should seek a balance between internal and external promotions so they can retain knowledge about complex processes and also bring in new ideas and a positive attitude toward change. While promoting from within often yields high quality candidates who can operate effectively in the City environment, the City may sometimes overlook talented external candidates with a valuable diversity of experience and perspectives. In addition, hiring high quality employees from other departments will become less feasible as the talent pool shrinks.

Public Sector Work is Less Appealing

In general, fewer people entering the workforce display an interest in public service compared to their parents' generation. Of those that do, many seek work outside of government, in nonprofit and community-based organizations. This attitude, in combination with experience requirements for many positions, makes it harder for government organizations, including the City, to recruit new workers.

Recruitment is Insufficient

Although recruitment activities have increased in some areas, managers agree efforts are not proactive enough, and site staff shortages as the reason. Publicly posting positions and notifying interested individuals about openings is only the first step in recruiting. Despite decreased interest in public service among some worker groups, the City could effectively market itself as an employer of choice in terms of salary, health and retirement benefits, working conditions, public purpose, and work-life balance. In addition, staff in several departments said that compared to other jurisdictions, San Francisco is "behind the times" in adopting new industry standards and service delivery philosophies. This exacerbates recruitment problems.

A Variety of Approaches are Needed

In some cases, the problems are known and their solutions are relatively simple to implement, but require funding (e.g. supervisory and management skills training). In other cases, solutions

will need to be carefully design in order to succeed (e.g. apprenticeship programs). Many departments are reluctant to invest or participate in programs they perceive as unlikely to receive initial or ongoing support. Training efforts are commonly underfunded or viewed as an easy target for cuts, particularly in public sector organizations, and San Francisco is no exception.¹³

¹³ In FY 2005-06 budget discussions, over \$350,000 in training funds were recommended to be cut.

Appendix A. City Workforce Data

Table of Contents

1	FY 2005-06 Workforce Analysis Summary	A-1
2	FY 2006-07 Updated Citywide Workforce Data	A-3
2.1	Age and Length of Service	A-3
2.2	New Hires	A-3
2.3	Separations	A-6
2.4	Retirement Milestones – Miscellaneous Employees	A-6
2.5	Retirement Milestones – Sworn Personnel	A-8
2.6	Retirement Milestones – By Union.....	A-8

6 FY 2005-06 Workforce Analysis Summary

In November 2006 DHR published its first Workforce Analysis. The following findings are excerpted from this report. Findings were drawn from employee data as of May 17, 2006, and exclude employees of the San Francisco Unified School District and Community College District, the Trial Courts, as well as Board members, commissioners, elected officials, and temporary exempt employees with as-needed schedules. Citywide averages include sworn members of the Police and Fire Departments. All other data in this report reflect employee statistics as of October 1, 2006, and citywide figures exclude sworn members of the Police and Fire Departments, which are analyzed separately.

- **Age and Length of Service** The average employee is 47 years old with a length of service of 13 years. This has increased since FY 2001-02, when the average employee was 46 years old with 12 years of service.
- **New Hires**¹⁴ Between FY 2001-02 and FY 2005-06, the Department of Public Health consistently had the largest number of new hires. Other departments with large numbers of new hires during the period include MTA – Metropolitan Transit Agency, Human Services Agency, Police Department, and Public Utilities Commission. Hiring was highest in all years of the FY 2001-02 to FY 2005-06 period among the 24-34 age group, followed by the 34-44 and 45-54 age groups.
- **Separations**¹⁵ On average, between FY 2001-02 and FY 2005-06, 80% of separations were voluntary on the part of employees, and 20% were involuntary. The main reasons for voluntary separations were retirements and resignations, while involuntary separations were due to layoffs and terminations. The total number of separations decreased in FY 2002-03, due to a large (20%) drop in resignations, perhaps due to the tighter labor market conditions at that time. Total separations increased slightly in FY 2003-04 due to layoffs, spiked in FY 2004-05 due to layoffs and a particularly large number of retirements, and returned to FY 2003-04 levels in FY 2005-06.

¹⁴ New hires refer to employees who are new to City service. They exclude hires of temporary exempt employees as well as movements of existing employees among departments through reassignments, transfers, promotions, demotions, and rehires made within a week of a prior appointment.

¹⁵ Separations refer to employees who leave City service. These separations can be voluntary (e.g. retirements and resignations) or involuntary (e.g. layoffs). They exclude separations of temporary exempt employees.

- **Retirement Eligibility by Department** Retirement “milestones” refer to combinations of age and years of service that represent minimum retirement eligibility requirements. Employees who are at least 50 years of age and have five or more years of service are eligible for a vesting retirement (i.e. health benefits and a small monthly allowance). Those who are 50 years of age with 20 years of service or 60 years of age with 10 years of service are eligible for full retirement benefits. Citywide, 38% of employees are at the 50-5 milestone, and at least 18% are at the 50-20 or 60-10 milestone. In the Police Department, almost one quarter (24%) of current employees are at least 50 years old and have 20 years of service. In the Recreation & Park and Juvenile Probation departments, over 25% of employees have reached this milestone.
- **Retirement Eligibility by Union** TWU Local 200 SEAM has a higher proportion of employees at the 50-5 and 50-20 milestones than any other union—71% and 51%, respectively—followed by Supervising Probation Officers (64% and 50%) and Supervising Nurses (66% and 39%).
- **Turnover Rates** Between FY 2001-02 and FY 2005-06, the turnover rate peaked at 8.5% in FY 2004-05 due to layoff-related separations (i.e. layoffs and early retirements to mitigate the effects of layoffs) and higher numbers of regular retirements and resignations. The overall turnover rate was lowest in FY 2002-03 at 5.9% and averaged 6.8% during the period. Turnover was highest in departments providing General Administration & Finance services (average of 8.6%) and lowest in those providing Public Works, Transportation, and Commerce services (average of 5.9%).
- **Promotive Leaves** On a discretionary basis, departments may grant their employees promotive leaves from their permanent positions to accept an exempt or provisional position with higher pay and responsibility. Departments can backfill the vacancy, but the employee retains rights to the position. In April 2005, 716 employees were on such leave; the average time on leave at the time was 3.6 years. In June 2006, the number of employees on promotive leave had increased by 27% to 907 employees, and the average time on leave dropped by 19.4% to 2.9 years.
- **FY 2004-05 Applicant Characteristics** Applicant characteristics in any given year depend on the exams being conducted. In FY 2004-05, 14,532 applicants submitted 24,460 applications for City positions. Of the applicants, 48% resided in San Francisco. Over 92 % of all applicants lived in one of the nine Bay Area counties.
- **FY 2004-05 Applications** Nearly half (45%) of all permanent civil service job examinations conducted in FY 2004-05 had five or fewer applicants. Just over a quarter (28%) had between six and 50 applicants and 27% had 50 or more. Application volume in any given year depends on the exams being conducted, but entry level positions generally draw the largest applicant pools. Of the ten classes drawing the most applications in FY 2004-05, four were transit classes, two were clerical, and one each was for entry level eligibility workers, engineers, emergency dispatchers, and librarians.

7 FY 2006-07 Updated Citywide Workforce Data

As mentioned above, data in the FY 2005-06 Workforce Analysis were presented for all City employees as a whole, as of May 17, 2006. Given the distinct differences in employment and retirement patterns among miscellaneous and sworn personnel,¹⁶ figures for sworn members of the Police and Fire departments are presented separately from all other employees in this section of updated data as of October 1, 2006.

7.1 Age and Length of Service

The average miscellaneous employee is 47.9 years old with 12.7 years of service. The average sworn employee is 43.3 years old with 15.3 years of service.

Misc. and Sworn Employees by Age Group

Age Group	Miscellaneous		Sworn	
	#	%	#	%
<25	191	0.8%	35	0.9%
25-34	2,617	10.9%	633	16.8%
35-44	6,169	25.8%	1,462	38.7%
45-54	8,648	36.2%	1,295	34.3%
55-64	5,604	23.4%	334	8.9%
65+	677	2.8%	15	0.4%
Total	23,906	100.0%	3,774	100.0%
Average Age	47.9		43.3	

Source: HR Information System

Misc. & Sworn Employees by Length of Service Group

LOS Group	Miscellaneous		Sworn	
	#	%	#	%
<5	4,636	19.4%	500	13.2%
5 - 9	7,129	29.8%	806	21.4%
10 - 14	3,455	14.5%	739	19.6%
15 - 19	3,237	13.5%	488	12.9%
20 - 24	2,612	10.9%	408	10.8%
25 - 29	1,863	7.8%	593	15.7%
30+	974	4.1%	240	6.4%
Total	23,906	100.0%	3,774	100.0%
Average LOS	12.7		15.3	

Source: HR Information System

7.2 New Hires

Sworn personnel comprised 11% of all new hires Citywide between FY 2001-02 and FY 2005-06. Hiring was highest in all five years among the 24-34 age group for both sworn and

¹⁶ In general, police officers and firefighters become City employees at younger ages, are more likely to remain with the City for most of their careers, and retire at younger ages (approximately 55 years versus 60 years) than miscellaneous employees.

miscellaneous employees, followed by the 34-44 age group. The third largest age group for sworn new hires was the <25 age group, while for miscellaneous employees, it was the 45-54 age group. While 97% of sworn personnel new hires were under 45, 73% of miscellaneous new hires were under the age of 45.

Sworn Personnel New Hires by Age Group

Age Group	FY02	FY03	FY04	FY05	FY06	Total
<25	20	32	2	27	44	125
25-34	92	95	29	87	120	423
35-44	33	39	15	40	42	169
45-54	3	2	1	7	6	19
55-64	1	1				2
65+						0
Total	149	169	47	161	212	738
Source: HR Information System						

Miscellaneous New Hires by Age Group

Age Group	FY02	FY03	FY04	FY05	FY06	Total
<25	109	71	56	70	84	390
25-34	617	363	306	379	448	2113
35-44	540	318	311	274	424	1867
45-54	357	223	193	207	263	1243
55-64	84	46	60	75	99	364
65+	3	3	5	6	4	21
Total	1,710	1,024	931	1,011	1,322	5,998
Source: HR Information System						

Sworn Personnel New Hires by Department

Dept	FY02	FY03	FY04	FY05	FY06	Total
FIR	62	89		79	72	302
POL	87	80	47	82	140	436
Total	149	169	47	161	212	738
Source: HR Information System						

Miscellaneous New Hires by Department

Dept	FY02	FY03	FY04	FY05	FY06	Total
AAM	3	27	1	1	6	38
ADM	25	25	8	15	22	95
ADP	4	2	1			7
AGE	3	1	2			6
AIR	34	18	21	50	43	166
ART	6	1		2	2	11
ASR	3	7	9	4	13	36
BOS	9	9	14	12	7	51
CAT	33	14	34	15	25	121
CFC	3	2		3	3	11
CHF	12	5	1	4	10	32
CON	16	11	9	31	20	87
CPC	23	2	3	5	30	63
CSC					2	2
CSS	22	3	7	13	9	54
DAT	10	7	10	23	22	72
DBI	7	3	14	6	30	60
DPH	550	376	269	361	376	1932
DPW	26	33	14	29	46	148
DSS	96	64	72	93	154	479
ECD	19	48	40	43	47	197
ECN	2	1	2	3	3	11
ENV	10	14	20	11	8	63
ETH		1		1	1	3
FAM				2	12	14
FIR	8	3	2	1	3	17
HRC		1		1		2
HRD	9	7	4	6	16	42
HSS					4	4
JUV	5		1	1	1	8
LIB	24	7	18	11	18	78
MTA	353	146	120	67	86	772
MYR	20	8	32	19	18	97
PAB	1				1	2
PDR	14	19	28	5	13	79
POL	18	6	1	9	12	46
PRT	18	7	3	5	17	50
PUC	80	60	116	99	101	456
REC	80	23	19	25	36	183
REG	2	1	1	1	1	6
RET	1	3	7	3	7	21
RNT		4			2	6
SCI	1					1
SHF	110	42	6	11	62	231
TIS	34	5	15	6	16	76
TTX	10	6	7	12	8	43
TXC		1			6	7
WAR	3			1		4
WOM	3	1		1	3	8
Total	1,710	1,024	931	1,011	1,322	5,998

Source: HR Information System

7.3 Separations

Miscellaneous and sworn personnel separations were also analyzed separately for the FY 2001-02 through FY 2005-06 period. During that time, 69% of sworn personnel leaving City employment retired and 31% left for reasons other than retirement (most separations in the “termination” category are resignations). The average age at retirement of sworn personnel was 56.0, while for miscellaneous employees it was higher at 60.4 years.

Average Age of Separation - Sworn vs. Miscellaneous

Group	Action	Number of Employees	Ave. Age at Separation
Sworn	Retirement	736	56.0
	Termination	331	36.5
	Sworn Total	1,067	49.9
Miscellaneous	Layoff	487	46.4
	Retirement	3,133	60.4
	Termination	4,796	43.9
	Non-sworn Total	8,416	50.2

Source: HR Information System

Note: Data from FY01-02 to FY05-06

7.4 Retirement Milestones – Miscellaneous Employees

Retirement “milestones” refer to combinations of age and years of service that represent minimum retirement eligibility requirements. For miscellaneous employees, an employee who is at least 50 years of age and has five or more years of service is eligible for a vesting retirement (i.e. health benefits and a small monthly allowance). An employee who is 50 years of age with 20 years of service or 60 years of age with 10 years of service is eligible for a service retirement. Forty-one percent of miscellaneous employees are at the 50-5 milestone, 18% are at the 50-20 milestone and 7% are at the 60-10 milestone. In the Recreation & Park and Juvenile Probation departments, over 25% of employees have reached the 50-20 milestone.

Retirement Milestones for Misc. Employees by Department Based on Age & LOS

Department	Total # of EEs	% of EEs by Age & LOS		
		% 50-5	% 50-20 (sort order)	% 60-10
HUMAN RIGHTS	36	47%	33%	14%
WAR MEMORIAL	93	61%	29%	15%
RECREATION & PARK	848	46%	26%	7%
JUVENILE PROBATION	243	44%	25%	9%
POLICE	337	47%	24%	11%
RETIREMENT SYSTEM	73	44%	23%	15%
ADULT PROBATION	103	44%	22%	9%
MTA - MUNICIPAL RAILWAY	4,729	46%	22%	8%
FIRE DEPARTMENT	97	47%	22%	13%
CONTROLLER	168	38%	21%	12%
GENERAL SVCS AGENCY - TELECOM&INFO SVCS	271	45%	21%	7%
PORT	209	50%	20%	10%
CHILD SUPPORT SERVICES	130	37%	20%	8%
ASSESSOR / RECORDER	114	46%	19%	12%
PUBLIC UTILITIES	1,924	41%	19%	8%
HUMAN RESOURCES	156	42%	19%	6%
DISTRICT ATTORNEY	253	32%	18%	8%
PUBLIC HEALTH	5,908	41%	17%	7%
TREASURER/TAX COLLECTOR	203	45%	17%	12%
PUBLIC LIBRARY	701	37%	17%	6%
GENERAL SERVICES AGENCY - PUBLIC WORKS	1,180	41%	16%	8%
CITY PLANNING	139	27%	16%	3%
DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION	278	45%	16%	10%
FINE ARTS MUSEUM	102	37%	16%	4%
HUMAN SERVICES AGENCY	1,820	38%	16%	7%
PUBLIC DEFENDER	147	21%	15%	1%
CITY ATTORNEY	321	33%	15%	5%
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS	55	25%	15%	2%
RENT ARBITRATION BOARD	29	55%	14%	7%
AIRPORT	1,273	48%	13%	8%
ARTS COMMISSION	24	38%	13%	8%
ADMIN SERVICES	387	40%	11%	5%
HEALTH SERVICE SYSTEM	36	39%	11%	6%
EMERGENCY COMMUNICATIONS DEPARTMENT	224	19%	11%	3%
SHERIFF	932	21%	10%	2%
MAYOR	114	20%	7%	6%
ASIAN ART MUSEUM	57	23%	4%	5%
ELECTIONS	34	21%	3%	3%
ETHICS	12	17%	0%	0%
ECONOMIC & WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT	18	6%	0%	0%
CHILDREN, YOUTH & THEIR FAMILIES	32	3%	0%	3%
ENVIRONMENT	58	9%	0%	0%
ALL OTHER DEPARTMENTS	38	18%	8%	5%
Total Employees	23,906			
Average, All Departments		41%	18%	7%
Source: HR Information System				

7.5 Retirement Milestones – Sworn Personnel

Retirement eligibility requirements for sworn personnel vary depending on date of hire. Employees hired before 1976 must be 50 years old with 25 years of service to be eligible for full retirement benefits. Employees that joined after 1976 must be 50 years old with 5 years of service to be eligible for full retirement benefits. Both groups must be 55 years old or above to reach the 3% cap, at which maximum retirement benefits may reach 90% of final compensation. Twenty-five percent of sworn fire personnel and 27% of sworn police personnel are eligible for minimum retirement benefits.

Retirement Milestones for Sworn Employees Based on Age & LOS

Department	Total # of EEs	% of EEs by Age & LOS		
		Joined Pre-1976 % 50-5	1976 & Beyond % 50-20 (sort order)	% Total Min Elig.
FIRE	1,602	4%	22%	25%
POLICE	2,172	7%	20%	27%
Total Sworn Personnel	3,774			
Percentage at Milestone		6%	21%	26%
Source: HR Management System				

7.6 Retirement Milestones – By Union

Of miscellaneous employees, Supervising Probation Officers Local 3 has a higher proportion of employees at the 50-5 and 50-20 milestones than any other union—64% and 50%, respectively—followed by TWU Local 200 SEAM (69% and 48%) and Supervising Nurses (67% and 39%). For sworn personnel, over a quarter of employees in all unions are eligible for retirement benefits, ranging from 50% in the Municipal Executive Association - Police to 25 % of employees in Locals 798 & 799, Firefighters.

Sworn Personnel by Union Eligible for Retirement

Code	Union	Total # of EEs	Eligible Employees	
			#	%
798	Locals 798 & 799, Firefighters	1,594	404	25%
352	Municipal Executive Association - Fire	8	3	38%
353	Municipal Executive Association - Police	2	1	50%
911	Police Officers Association	2,170	582	27%
Total Employees		3,774	990	
Average, All Unions				26%
Source: HR Management System				

Retirement Milestones for Misc. Employees by Union Based on Age & LOS

Code	Union	Total # of EEs	% of EEs by Age & LOS		
			% 50-5	% 50-20 (sort order)	% 60-10
965	Supervising Probation Officers, Local 3	14	64%	50%	7%
200	TWU Local 200, SEAM	275	69%	48%	8%
858	Local 856, Teamsters - Supervising Nurse	110	67%	39%	12%
251	Local 250, TWU Miscellaneous	81	47%	37%	7%
003	Operating Engineers, Local 3	51	57%	33%	8%
006	Local 6, Electrical Workers	731	56%	30%	11%
040	Roofers, Local 40	10	40%	30%	0%
377	Iron Workers, Local 377	17	65%	29%	12%
856	Local 856, Teamsters - Multi-Unit	97	46%	26%	7%
969	SF Institutional Police Officers Association	8	75%	25%	13%
651	SF Probation Officers Association	135	44%	24%	10%
351	Municipal Executives Association	811	49%	24%	8%
130	Local 1414, Machinists	373	57%	23%	6%
104	Sheet Metal Workers, Local 104	45	60%	22%	2%
004	Painters, Local 4	95	48%	22%	5%
793	Fire Rescue Paramedic, Local 793	14	50%	21%	7%
791	SEIU - Nurses	1,329	42%	21%	5%
039	Local 39, Stationary Engineers	553	52%	20%	8%
236	Carpenters, Local 22	93	55%	19%	6%
261	Local 261, Laborers International	928	38%	19%	5%
164	UAPD Physicians & Dentists	218	39%	18%	11%
022	Local 21, Professional & Technical Engineers	324	40%	18%	4%
216	Teamsters, Local 853 Truck Drivers	150	42%	17%	9%
790	SEIU Locals 790	6,997	41%	17%	9%
021	Local 21, Professional & Technical Engineers	3,206	37%	16%	8%
038	Local 38, Plumbers	309	40%	16%	8%
253	TWU Local 250-A, Transit Operators	2,073	42%	16%	7%
535	SEIU Local 535	1,391	38%	16%	7%
419	SFDA Investigators Association	52	27%	15%	8%
252	TWU Local 250-A, Automotive Service Workers	131	31%	15%	7%
311	Municipal Attorney's Association	420	27%	14%	4%
250	SEIU Locals 250	1,812	40%	13%	8%
163	UAPD Physicians & Dentists	10	10%	10%	0%
718	Glaziers, Local 718	11	45%	9%	0%
580	Cement Masons, Local 580	24	33%	8%	4%
498	SF Deputy Sheriff's Association	759	17%	8%	1%
016	Theatrical Stage Employees, Local 16	14	21%	7%	7%
034	Pile Drivers, Local 34	14	29%	7%	0%
001	Unrepresented Employees - Miscellaneous	57	25%	7%	5%
930	SF Building Inspectors	70	41%	4%	10%
002	Unrepresented Employees - Management	63	14%	2%	6%
	All Other Unions	31	39%	10%	3%
Total Employees		23,906			
Average, All Unions			41%	18%	7%
Source: HR Information System					

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

This appendix expands upon report section 2.5 Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning. It provides detailed roles and responsibilities and steps to implementing a WSP plan. This model will change over time based on the experience of departments as it is implemented throughout the City.

Table of Contents

1	Roles and Responsibilities in a WSP Plan.....	B-1
2	Developing a WSP Plan.....	B-2
2.1	Context.....	B-2
2.2	Scope.....	B-3
2.3	Work	B-3
2.4	Demand.....	B-4
2.5	Supply	B-4
2.6	Gap Analysis.....	B-5
2.7	Priorities	B-5
2.8	Solutions	B-6
2.9	Success Measures.....	B-7
2.10	Implement, Monitor, Evaluate & Improve	B-7
3	Communication of the Plan	B-7
	Exhibits 1-5.....	B-9 to B-13

1 Roles and Responsibilities in a WSP Plan

In a WSP Plan, there are various individuals and teams that play a critical role throughout the life of the plan. The groups are listed below, with details on each of the specific roles played in a WSP plan.

Senior Leader: The Senior Leader is the department head, or top manager of the department. The commitment from the Senior Leader is critical to a successful plan. The Senior Leader acts as a sponsor of the WSP plan and may determine the Scope of the WSP plan. The Senior Leader also decides who is on the Stakeholder Team and the WSP Coordinator.

Stakeholder Team: The Stakeholder Team is comprised of managers and directors representing the major divisions of the department. The Stakeholder Team is responsible overall for the success of the WSP plan. Along with the Senior Leader, the Stakeholder Team decides who is on the Design Team and monitors the work of the Design Team. They ensure that the Design Team has the necessary time and resources to develop the WSP plan.

WSP Coordinator: The WSP Coordinator participates in the Design Team and acts as a liaison between the Stakeholder Team and the Design Team, the Implementation Team, and the Evaluation Team.

Design Team: The Design Team encompasses representatives from the operational divisions of the organization, and should include human resources, training, finance, and information

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

technology. Ideally, the Design Team consists of 10-12 people. The role of the Design Team is to go through each of the WSP steps and to develop solutions to present to the Senior Leader and the Stakeholder Team.

Implementation Team: Upon approval of the solutions by the Senior Leader and the Stakeholder Team, the Implementation Team outlines a project plan for implementation of the solutions and is responsible for implementing the WSP plan. The composition of the Implementation Team is dependent upon the solutions being implemented.

Evaluation Team: The Evaluation Team is made up of department leaders, the WSP Coordinator, human resources and operational managers. The Evaluation Team is responsible for the evaluation of the WSP plan.

2 Developing a WSP Plan

There are many models available to develop a WSP plan. The following example is a combination of two very similar models, the State of New York Model¹⁷ and the CPS Workforce Continuity Model.¹⁸ It is important to note that a WSP plan is not a static plan. It is something that should be constantly modified and revised as needed, in order to effectively address the needs of the department.

The purpose of a WSP plan is to look to the development of a department's future workforce. Generally, organizations look out 3-5 years into the future when addressing their WSP plans. However, if a department has an urgent need, that issue should be addressed first.

Listed below is an outline of the ten steps involved in developing a WSP plan.

2.1 Context

Purpose: Determine what impacts the WSP efforts – both internally and externally.

Questions to Consider When Determining the Context:

- What is the direction of the department?
- What changes are occurring in the external environment of the department?
- What are your customer/client expectations?
- Are there emerging developments in technology that will change the way the work is done in the department?
- Are there some legislative changes that will impact the department?
- Are there some budgetary changes in the department?
- What are the employment trends that may be affecting the department?

¹⁷ Our Work Force Matters: A Guide to Work Force and Succession Planning for New York State Agencies. September 2001. New York State Department of Civil Service and the New York State Governor's Office of Employee Relations.

¹⁸ Workforce Succession Planning and CPS Workforce Continuity Model. 2007. CPS Human Resource Services. March.

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

Responsibilities: The Stakeholder Team takes responsibility for setting the context and the Senior Leader and WSP Coordinator should be involved.

Tools to Utilize to Determine the Context

- Department's vision, mission and goals
- Department's strategic plan
- Industry groups and/or publications (i.e., American Library Association, International Public Management Association for Human Resources, etc.)
- Information from other jurisdictions and agencies
- SWOT analysis (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats) of the department

2.2 Scope

Purpose: Determine the nature and scale of the WSP efforts. The scope should be focused, manageable and set within a reasonable time period.

Questions to Consider When Determining the Scope

- What area or function will be the focus of the plan?
- Is it the entire department or one division of the department?
- Is it one classification or a function?
- Is there an urgent situation that must be addressed or is there time to plan ahead?

Responsibilities: Setting the scope is the responsibility of the management of the organization. It can either be the Senior Leader or the Senior Leader in conjunction with the Stakeholder Team.

2.3 Work

Purpose: Determine what work will need to be done. Focus on the operational functions, not the people doing the work or the positions in the budget. Begin with a good understanding of the existing functions of the department.

Questions to Consider When Identifying the Work

- What operational functions will remain the same?
- What operational functions will change?
- Are there obsolete functions?
- Are there new functions?
- What are the anticipated work load volumes?
- Will the department's services change?
- Will new services be offered by the department?
- Will there be some new technological changes? If so, what are they?

Responsibilities: The Design Team identifies the work to be done and the WSP Coordinator communicates this information to the Stakeholder Team for approval.

Tools to Utilize in Identifying the Work:

- Organizational Job Analysis Template (Exhibit 1, page B-9))

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

2.4 Demand

Purpose: Determine what staff will be needed to perform the functions as identified within the scope.

Questions to Consider When Determining the Demand

- What competencies¹⁹, knowledge, skills and abilities are needed to perform the functions?
- What classifications could be utilized?
- Are there some competencies, knowledge, skills and abilities that do not fit within existing classifications?
- What staffing levels would be required by classification and/or competency?
- What are the potential impacts of technology, budget, organization, work process and service delivery changes on the competencies and staffing levels?

Responsibilities: The Design Team is responsible for determining the Demand.

Tools to Utilize in Determining the Demand

- DHR core and basic technical competency dictionary
- Detailed technical competency lists or models
 - Purchased and modified by department
 - Development of own competencies by department
- Information from professional organizations of related occupations

Deliverable: List of competencies per function and number of needed positions per classification.

2.5 Supply

Purpose: Determine what candidates will be available. Profile the current workforce and determine the supply, based upon the scope and needed competencies. In determining the Supply, assume no hiring to replace employees who leave.

Questions to Consider When Determining the Supply

- What are the existing employee competencies, knowledge, skills and abilities based on the classifications?
- What are the employee-specific competencies, including those that fall outside of normal duties (i.e., ability to speak another language, etc.)?
- What are the demographics of the scope area re: classifications, retirements, educational level, etc.)?
- What are the attrition rates (including retirements, resignations, transfers and promotions)?
- What are the projected attrition rates, factoring in assumptions about the variables involved, i.e., likelihood of certain employees to retire?
- Based on the existing demographics and projected attrition rates by classification and competency set, what will the future composition of the workforce be without factoring in any hiring?

¹⁹ DHR is developing a dictionary of core and basic technical competencies to be available in July 2007.

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

Responsibilities: The Design Team is responsible for determining the Supply.

Tools to Utilize in Determining the Supply

- Incumbent Evaluation - Competency Template (Exhibit 2, page B-10)

Deliverable: List of competencies, per classification and number of available employees.

2.6 Gap Analysis

Purpose: Compare the Demand with the Supply to determine the gaps that need to be addressed. This is a two-step process to identify where the candidates will come from and then determine the gaps between Demand and Supply.

Questions to Consider When Determining the Supply

- Are there classifications that would be filled by promotions?
- If so, what are the qualifying classifications and possible qualifying classifications that feed into the promotional classifications?
- What classifications are sources of transfer candidates?
- Are there current eligible lists or registries for the classifications involved? If so, when are they scheduled to expire?
- If the current list will still be in effect for the planning horizon, how suitable are the available eligible candidates and how many are still likely to be on the list when they are needed?
- When will the next exam be held? How will the exam cycle contribute or detract from the department's ability to appoint qualified candidates?
- For classifications filled by exempt appointments, how many staff would need to be recruited externally?
- How many staff, by classification, will no longer be needed to perform their current functions?

Responsibilities: The Design Team is responsible for determining the Gaps.

Tools to Utilize in Conducting a Gap Analysis

- Gap Analysis Template (Exhibit 3, page B-11)

Deliverable: List of classifications and positions with gap numbers.

2.7 Priorities

Purpose: Determine which staffing gaps will have the most impact on the department's ability to achieve its goals. Prioritizing staffing needs are forward looking.

Questions to Consider When Establishing Priorities

- What staffing needs are critical to the delivery of the essential services of the department?
- What staffing needs are not critical, but necessary for the department to function smoothly?
- Which staffing gaps can be handled in a routine manner with a minimum commitment of resources?

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

- What is the impact of not addressing a staffing need?
- What is the benefit of addressing each staffing need?
- Based on the benefits and impacts identified, what is the relative priority of each of the needs?

Responsibilities: The Design Team proposes Priorities and the WSP Coordinator communicates this information to the Senior Leader and Stakeholder Team for approval.

Tools to Utilize in Establishing Priorities

- Prioritization of Positions Template (Exhibit 4, page 12)
- Position Rationale Template (Exhibit 5, page 13)

Deliverable: List of prioritized classifications and rationale for each priority classification.

2.8 Solutions

Purpose: Develop potential solutions to meet staffing needs based on the Priorities. Determine staff resources and other costs associated with addressing the problems.

Questions to Consider when Determining Solutions

- Based on the data and analysis, what strategies can be utilized to meet the staffing needs?
- Staff development strategies to prepare employees for positions or classifications?
- Recruitment and selection strategies to find and hire qualified candidates from other departments, jurisdictions or the private sector?
- Retention strategies to encourage employees to stay in the department?
- Position classification actions such as redefining/modifying classifications; developing new classifications; consolidating classifications, etc.?
- Organizations interventions such as staff reorganization?
- Knowledge transfer strategies to capture the knowledge of experienced employees before they leave the department?
- Is there enough time to develop staff internally for anticipated vacancies or new competency needs?
- Are there adequate resources available?
- Do existing staff demonstrate the potential or interest to develop new competencies and assume new positions or is external recruitment needed?
- How high is the competition for the needed future competencies?

Responsibilities: The Design Team is responsible for developing the Solutions and the WSP Coordinator communicates this to the Stakeholder Team for approval.

Tools to Utilize in Determining Solutions

- Information from other jurisdictions, public agencies and private companies

Deliverable: List of classifications, with solutions and a cost analysis of the solution.

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

2.9 Success Measures

Purpose: Develop measurable goals to determine if the WSP strategy is working.

Questions to Consider when Establishing Success Measures

- Who will use the results?
- How will the results be used?
- What does the department expect from the solutions?

Responsibilities: The Design Team is responsible for setting Success Measures and the WSP Coordinator communicates it to the Senior Leadership and Stakeholder Team for approval.

Tools to Utilize in Establishing Success Measures

- Industry groups and/or publications
- Information from other jurisdictions and agencies
- Information submitted to Controller's Performance Measures

Deliverable: List of measurements for success.

2.10 Implement, Monitor, Evaluate & Improve

Questions to Consider when Implementing

- Are the objectives clear and understood by everyone involved?
- Is the WSP consistent with the strategic operational and budget plans?
- What are the potential obstacles?
- What can you do to minimize the impact of potential obstacles?

Questions to Consider when Evaluating

- Has the strategic plan or other plans changed since beginning the WSP efforts?
- If so, what are the implications for the strategies implemented?
- Have the strategies implemented achieved the intended results?
- What worked well? What didn't?
- To what extent have demand and supply projections been borne out?
- Is a new analysis necessary before revising the strategies?
- What adjustments to the strategies are needed?

Responsibilities: The Implementation Team and the Evaluation Team.

Tools to Utilize During this Period

- Training Evaluation forms
- Exit Interviews
- Customer Survey Satisfaction forms

3 Communication of the Plan

In the development of a WSP Plan, there must be on-going dissemination of information about the WSP process taking place. The six steps and potential audiences are listed below, with details on each of the specific roles played in a WSP plan.

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

1. **Determine the Goal:** To initiate a successful and effective WSP communications effort, begin with an assessment of current organizational issues. Look closely at who the organization serves. This process will help narrow and sharpen the focus for the communication. Why is WSP important to the organization as a whole and important to the department/employees specifically?
2. **Identify and Profile the Audience:** Identify and profile specific audiences to target with the message(s). Two groups that must be included are union representatives and employees. Getting active participation from different groups means tailoring the message so that they understand what they gain from the WSP efforts. Identifying audiences helps in choosing the most effective ways to communicate with them.
3. **Develop Messages:** The messages are closely tied to the goal and objectives. Develop the message so that it delivers important information about the issue and compels the targeted audience to think, feel, or act. Tailor the message to each individual audience, whether within the department or outside of it.
4. **Activities and Materials:** Consider the activities, events, and/or materials that will most effectively carry the message to the intended audiences. Does everyone have internet access? Are there employees that work out of satellite offices or out in the field? Should there be some in-person interaction to discuss progress on the WSP Plan?
5. **Implement the Plan:** List out the time, dollars, staff, and deadlines needed to implement the initiative. Will it vary based on the audience? Will the WSP Plan be implemented in phases?
6. **Evaluate and Make Mid-Course Corrections:** Development of a communications plan will take place as the WSP Plan develops. Changes may be needed as the WSP Plan progresses. Specify times to take review, determine strengths and weaknesses, and identify obstacles in communicating the WSP Plan.

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

Exhibit 1. Organizational Job Analysis Template

Anticipated Changes:
Key Positions Affected:
New Education/Training:
Experience/Background Needed:
New Skills Needed:

Source: CPS Human Resource Services

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

Exhibit 2. Incumbent Evaluation - Competency Template

Competencies & Descriptions	Column 1 Importance of Competency	Column 2 Level of Knowledge need to perform job	Column 3 Self-Evaluation of Competency	Column 4 Development for Incumbent (up to 3)			Column 5 Development for Potential Incumbents (up to 3)		
	1. Not Important 2. Somewhat Important 3. Important 4. Very Important 5. Extremely Important	Select on a scale of 1-7, 1 being basic knowledge and 7 being high-level knowledge	A. Very High B. High C. Good D. Competent E. To Develop	A. Formal Training B. Cross Training C. Work with SME D. Focused Task E. Other Rank Top 3			A. Formal Training B. On the Job Training C. Cross Training D. Work with SME E. Other Rank Top 3		
Competency Name				1	2	3	1	2	3
Critical Thinking Using logic and reasoning to identify the strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions, or approaches to problems.									
Judgment and Decision-Making Considering the relative costs and benefits of potential actions to choose the most appropriate one.									
Active Learning Understanding the implications of new information for both current and future problem-solving and decision-making.									
Service Orientation Actively looking for ways to help people.									
Reading Comprehension Understanding written sentences and paragraphs in work-related documents.									
Equipment Selection Determining the kind of tools and equipment needed to do a job.									

Sources: Who will do the work of San Francisco? June 2003; and DHR Core Competencies Dictionary

Note: (1) Columns 3-5 are based on the model in Who will do the work of San Francisco? report, and (2) Columns 1 and 2, plus the competencies listed in the left hand column are drawn from the DHR Core Competencies Dictionary.

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

Exhibit 3. Gap Analysis Template

Department X	Job Class	Unit 1	Unit 2	Unit 3	Total
Supply Now (7/2007)					
Projected: Transfers					
Separations					
Other reasons					
Supply Then (7/2010)					
Demand (7/2010)					
Gap (needing to be filled)					

Source: New York State, Department of Civil Service

Sample of Gap Analysis for the 1241 Personnel Analyst Job Class

Department of Human Resources	Job Class	Exam Unit	Client Services Unit	EEO Unit	Total
Supply Now (7/2007)	1241 Personnel Analyst	20	13	5	38
Projected: Transfers		-2	-2	-1	-5
Separations		-1	0	0	-1
Promotions (to 1244 Sr. Personnel Analyst)		-2	-3	-1	-6
Supply Then (7/2010)		15	8	3	26
Demand (7/2010)		22	14	5	41
Gap (needing to be filled)		-7	-6	-2	-14

* These numbers were created for illustration purposes.

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

Exhibit 4. Prioritization of Positions Template

Using the information from the Work discussion and SWOT analysis discuss the following information and then complete the form to determine the positions to include in the Workforce Succession Plan. Remember to look 3-5 years in the future.

Positions Key to the Performance of the Mission of the organization:

Positions that add value, but do not need to be part of Workforce/Succession Planning:

Source: CPS Human Resource Services

Appendix B. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning

Exhibit 5. Position Rationale Template

Position title _____

After completing the form, re-evaluate if this is indeed a critical position needing to be included in the Plan. Each potential position needs a completed form for inclusion in the Plan.

Essential Duties:
Rationale for Why This is a Key Position:
Problems Created by Vacancy or Vacancies:
Timing of Anticipated Vacancy or Vacancies:

Source: CPS Human Resource Services

Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

Table of Contents

1	Civil Service Reform and WSP Efforts	C-1
2	Workforce and Succession Planning Efforts in Other Jurisdictions	C-2
2.1	Leadership Support	C-2
2.2	Recruitment and Hiring.....	C-3
2.2.1	Flexibility in the Hiring Process	C-3
2.2.2	Internship	C-3
2.3	Training/Career Development	C-4
2.3.1	Competency-Based Training for a Job Series.....	C-4
2.3.2	Mentoring Program.....	C-4
2.3.3	Grow-Your-Own Program.....	C-4
2.3.4	Developmental Assessments and Tools.....	C-5
2.3.5	Leadership Academies.....	C-5
2.4	Retention.....	C-6
2.5	Knowledge Management	C-7

1 Civil Service Reform and WSP Efforts

In researching WSP best practices in local, state and federal jurisdictions, many innovative efforts and promising practices were identified. It is important to note that many of these efforts have been implemented by DHR as described in Section 3. History of City Workforce & Succession Planning Efforts. WSP efforts being implemented by other City departments are described in Appendix D. Selected Detail Analysis. Below is a summary of some initiatives:

Position-based testing On February 6, 2006, the Civil Service Commission adopted Civil Service Rule 111A *Position Based Testing* to advance one of the City’s key initiatives for faster permanent hiring. This process will promote efficiency in hiring and help make the City a competitive employer while retaining the principles for merit based examinations.

Online Job Applications In February 2007, DHR implemented a web-based application and referral system. Applicants can apply for a City job online and City human resource professionals can review applicant qualifications in real time. This system is expected to attract a larger number of more qualified candidates. It will gather additional useful data about applicants (i.e., educational levels) and make the application process more efficient.

Recruitment Services DHR initiated Recruitment Services, coordinated by the Recruiting Program Manager. The City has an integrated advertising program which consolidates four major advertising sources and offers recruitment consulting support to departments. The development of Recruitment Services is a positive step forward. However, as noted in Section 5. Preliminary Findings on City WSP Readiness & Needs, the City’s recruitment and marketing efforts are still insufficient to effectively compete with other jurisdictions and the private sector.

Continuous Police Testing The Police Department and DHR initiated the Accelerated Police Officer Hiring Program, which dramatically decreases the time required to hire potential police officers. On a monthly basis, candidates complete a short job application and Personal History

Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

Questionnaire and take the California Peace Officers Standards & Training (POST) exam. After passing the POST written examination, the candidate's name is placed on a tentative eligible list. Physical ability exams and department interviews are also held on a monthly basis. This innovative testing program will allow the City to be more competitive in hiring the candidates that all jurisdictions are vying for.

Prop F Retirees This policy allows retired City employees to return to City employment on a part-time basis. This would enable retirees to contribute to WSP efforts including mentoring, coaching or knowledge transfer.

Training Initiatives DHR implements monthly training for supervisors (24-PLUS for Supervisors and Managers) and established City University (CU), a partnership with educational institutions, labor organizations, business and philanthropic communities, to provide learning opportunities for City employees. It provides access to career ladders, skill building opportunities and professional development opportunities for employees. CU is also addressing WSP training needs in the City.

Competencies DHR is developing a core competency dictionary, which will be available in July 2007.

2 Workforce and Succession Planning Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

This section presents other WSP solutions that met the needs of local, state, and federal jurisdictions. These examples are excerpted primarily from two sources – *The Aging-and-Retiring Government Workforce- How Serious Is the Challenge: What Are Jurisdictions Doing About It?* by the Center for Organizational Research and *Building the Leadership Pipeline in Local, State, and Federal Government* by CPS Human Resource Services. Both sources utilized previously published materials, government and human resource associations and organizations, experts, researchers and academics, and interviews with various agencies to select the case studies. The case studies presented were based on different levels of government and a variety of approaches to workforce development in light of the challenges faced by the agencies.

In creating a WSP plan, the tendency may be to make assumptions about the problem, and immediately look for solutions by learning from similar successful strategies used in other jurisdictions. However, as mentioned in Section 2.5. Steps to Workforce and Succession Planning, solutions should be directly linked to the problem issue being addressed.

2.1 Leadership Support

All successful WSP plans must be supported by both the top management of the organization in addition to support throughout the organization.

The **City of Thousand Oaks (CA)** employs 650 full-time and part-time employees. To address the need of developing their future leaders, a comprehensive Succession Planning Program was developed. Originally conceived by key executives, all managers and supervisors were involved

Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

in the initial planning process. Supervisors and managers were presented with the mission to develop future leaders within the organization and raise awareness and enthusiasm for public service in the larger community. All executive team members were actively involved in one or more initiatives with executives each chairing a committee, thereby supporting the mission and being invested in the success of the program. A citywide succession planning program kick-off was held to introduce new initiatives, update progress on committees, and provide more comprehensive details on the Mentoring Program and Leadership Academy; employees attended Citywide brown-bag lunches. Ongoing communication to employees includes emails about events and regular updates through the Human Resources quarterly newsletter.²⁰

2.2 Recruitment and Hiring

Jurisdictions face many challenges in hiring workers needed to perform services, from a limited pool of candidates to competition among jurisdictions to working within civil services rules.

2.2.1 Flexibility in the Hiring Process

The **Department of Tax and Finance for the State of New York** has a comprehensive recruitment program for auditors, accountants, and IT professionals to increase the department's candidate pool. One component of their recruitment of college students is the ability to make an offer of employment to college students prior to graduation. For the auditor and accountant positions, this is critical since most college students are seeking employment commitments during the fall semester of their senior year. This recruitment strategy enables the department to make an offer to the students (as is done with the private sector competitors), with a start date after graduation. The department has also increased its participation in campus-based and virtual career fairs, guest speakers in college classes, internships, and job shadowing programs. Lastly, the department has a Career Opportunities section on the department's website with an email connection to human resources and a subscription feature to facilitate the distribution of new information.²¹

2.2.2 Internship

Three Florida cities—**Port Orange, South Daytona Beach and Daytona Beach Shores**—were concerned with their ability to hire future city managers due to a variety of reasons, including current city managers not retiring and the limitations on career opportunities for younger people. A key factor for a city manager job is that the knowledge and skills can only be gained through experience. Faced with this challenge, the three cities collaborated on a two-year city manager internship program and pooled funds to pay the salary of one intern. The intern moves through a series of three full-time eight-month rotations in progressively larger jurisdictions. The rotations allow the intern to work with different city managers, city councils, and organizational issues.

²⁰ Hickman, Connie. 2006. Thousand Oaks Succession Planning PowerPoint Presentation. City of Thousand Oaks. October.

²¹ Taxation & Finance Recruitment Program. New York State Department of Civil Service. <http://www.cs.state.ny.us/successionplanning/agencyinitiatives/taxrecruitment.cfm>

Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

This method is one way in which an agency can bring in entry-level workers with technical training but limited public sector experience, within budget constraints.²²

2.3 Training/Career Development

This strategy includes a number of initiatives including – training, mentoring/coaching, apprenticeships, individual development plans, leadership development and more.

2.3.1 Competency-Based Training for a Job Series

The **City and County of Denver (CO)** has an Administrative Professional Training Program (APEX) as a bridge from the traditional role of “clerk” or “secretary” to that of an administrative professional. This one-year, structured training program is designed exclusively for employees who work in office, secretarial, support, clerical, administrative, and executive assistant positions. Participants in the program are committed to 16-20 hours of activities, a combination of self-paced online training, classroom instruction and activities, project team work and self study. Applicants and supervisors must fully participate, commit, support, and approve the fees, requirements and standards as outlined in the program. The curriculum is aligned with technical competencies that have been identified and validated for this group of workers.²³

2.3.2 Mentoring Program

The **State of New York’s Department of Transportation (DOT)** has a comprehensive mentoring program. The goal of the program is to assist in the development of employee skills, techniques and perspectives, and to help develop managers and leaders within the DOT. The one-year program provides guidance in career planning, personal development, and help in achieving the department’s goals. Mentors and protégés are partnered on a one-to-one basis – mentors with certain skills/experiences are matched with protégés who have identified a related desire to attain those skills/experiences. Together they work to set goals and identify activities that will assist the protégé in meeting their goals. The DOT utilizes several templates for their program including a Mentor Application form, Mentor and Protégé Agreement, Agreement of Confidentiality, Goal Setting Form and Developmental Worksheet.²⁴ Mentoring programs can be tools for recruitment, retention and knowledge transfer.

2.3.3 Grow-Your-Own Program

The **City of Phoenix (AZ)** has a workforce of almost 15,000 employees. Due to future retirements, a Workforce Planning Committee conducted a gap analysis and developed an action plan to close the gap by concentrating efforts in three areas: hard-to-attract positions (requiring robust recruitment plans), hard-to-keep positions (requiring additional retention efforts), and hard-to-fill positions (managed in part by a “grow-your-own” approach). The grow-your-own

²² CPS Human Resource Services. 2005. Building the Leadership Pipeline in Local, State & Federal Government.

²³ Administrative Professionals (APEX) Homepage. City and County of Denver.

<http://www.denvergov.org/APEX/HomePage/tabid/377959/Default.aspx>

²⁴ Department of Transportation Mentoring Program. New York State Department of Civil Service.

<http://www.cs.state.ny.us/successionplanning/agyinitiatives/dotmentor.cfm>

Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

strategy uses four methods: (1) Recruiting interns from outside of City government; (2) Expanding the internship program to include promising City employees who many intern with another department or in another skill area; (3) Establishing a formal mentoring program and (4) Developing a rotational program for employees to be cross-trained in another department or skill area while performing their regular job duties.²⁵

2.3.4 Developmental Assessments and Tools

In 2005, 29% of **Hendrico County's (VA)** upper managers were expected to be eligible for full retirement benefits. As a result, every department was mandated to report semi-annually on its progress in developing middle and upper managers as future leaders. Managers were provided with a guide to succession management that listed how he/she should identify key positions in the department, develop competencies needed, create an individual learning plan, and assess progress in developmental activities. The mandate was a means to ensure accountability to the WSP plan. Success is evident in the increased number of internal candidates applying for upper-manager positions, as well as the selection of more internal candidates for higher-level positions.²⁶

The **City of Roseville (CA)** was facing many challenges– high numbers of supervisor/manager retirements, an increased population growth with a projected increase in city services and a competition for talent. As a result, Roseville developed a Management Development Assessment Center as a mechanism for developing groups of employees. The assessment center is a method in which a group of employees take part in a series of activities, including written exercises, interviews and simulations, while being observed by trained assessors. The exercises mirror the competencies required by a higher-level position for which a participant may be considered in the future. Written feedback is provided to each participant through two reports. One report focuses on the management competencies and a summary of the participants overall strengths and developmental needs. The other report explains the participant's results of the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI). At the end of the assessment, the participant receives a consultation with an assessment center consultant. The city won the Helen Putnam Award from the League of California Cities for its use of assessment centers to promote employee development.²⁷

2.3.5 Leadership Academies

In 2001, the **City of Plano (TX)** realized that 46% of the city's top management would be eligible for retirement in five years. The city recognized the rapid demographic changes in the city and the need for new competencies necessary to manage city departments. Plano developed a twelve-month training program targeting experienced managers who have the potential to move into a senior leadership position. Participants in the Management Preparation Program of Plano (MP3) self-nominate or are nominated by an executive director or city manager. A participant must have a minimum of three years experience as a supervisor or manager, a bachelor's degree or demonstrated comparable experience, and must indicate the level of

²⁵ The Aging-and-Retiring Government Workforce: How Serious is the Challenge? What are Jurisdictions doing about it? 2003. The Center for Organizational Research.

²⁶ The Center for Organizational Research et al.

²⁷ CPS Human Resource Services et al.

Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

position they are interested in. The potential candidates participate in an assessment and recommendations are made to a selection team. The program involves visits to selected city departments, the mayor and the city council, 14 class sessions on various topics, one-on-one coaching by a senior manager, and a final project assigned by the city manager to address an important strategic challenge. As a result of MP3, several participants have been promoted, and other participants have functioned at higher performance levels in their current positions.²⁸

2.4 Retention

Retention strategies are an important component of any WSP plan and many of the retention strategies are a part of other WSP solutions. The range of strategies include flexible scheduling options, varied and/or rotational work assignments, employee surveys, opportunities for career development and job growth, new employee orientation, employee recognition, and mentoring/coaching. The U.S. Government Accounting Office has implemented several of these strategies.

The **U.S. Government Accounting Office (GAO)** had two issues to address— to recruit substantial numbers of entry-level employees over a period of several years, and to retain and develop those employees. The two-year Professional Development Program (PDP) was developed to bring new, entry-level analysts into the GAO, get them up to speed, and make them fully productive as quickly as possible. The GAO paid attention to details that influence how new employees felt about their employer and with this understanding, developed the PDP program to help retain the new hires. The components include (1) ensuring that everything is ready on the day they come in (i.e., computer set up, office supplies delivered, payroll system established); (2) providing a new employee orientation, which includes an orientation by a senior GAO staff person, briefing on GAO’s goals, core values and standards of performance, and a tour of the facility; (3) providing training on the telephone system and IT infrastructure; and (4) providing online training to learn GAO’s methodology. Next, the new recruits spend a week working on a case study that simulates an actual GAO assignment from start to finish.

Another component of the PDP program is the job rotation assignments. A PDP Advisor works with the new recruit to decide on their job rotation assignment. Through the program, a participant has three assignments, each lasting from seven to nine months. Upon completion of the program, a process occurs to match the preferences of both participants and managing directors. The job rotations give entry-level analysts an opportunity to determine their areas of interests and provide flexibility for the GAO. The PDP Advisor serves as an executive coach to the participant and manages the job rotations, keeping in close communication with the team supervisors.

To assist in the development of all of its programs, the GAO conducts research through published survey data and conducting its own research. The research assists them in the recruitment, retention, and development strategies for their employees. The surveys include a new employee online survey to inquire about their experiences as job applicants; an anonymous online exit survey to help identify factors that contribute to turnover within specific groups of

²⁸ CPS Human Resource Services et al

Appendix C. WSP Efforts in Other Jurisdictions

employees; and an Annual Employee Feedback survey to assess employee satisfaction with aspects of their jobs and to measure the agency's progress in areas that are targeted for improvement.²⁹

2.5 Knowledge Management

Knowledge management is vital in retaining the knowledge in critical job functions. Some jurisdictions rely on job shadowing programs, mentoring and developing systems to record information. Other jurisdictions utilize retirees to provide expertise, train successors, and knowledge transfer.

The **Tennessee Valley Authority** (TVA), with a projected 35% of the workforce retirement eligible, used a rating system called “knowledge loss through attrition” to assess the potential brain drain that could occur through retirements and other employee separations. TVA used three questions to drive their approach to capturing undocumented knowledge: (1) Specifically what knowledge is being lost? (2) What are the business consequences of losing each item of knowledge? and (3) What can we do about each item? TVA identified which job classifications posed the greatest risk of “knowledge attrition” based a combination of the estimated retirement date of the employee(s); an estimate of difficulty or effort required to replace the incumbent; and priority on managing the attrition. Incumbents and supervisors were interviewed to learn the job's knowledge content, both explicit and implicit. These were compiled into a list of knowledge loss items that were narrowed down to a critical few that required action. The results of the screening process of over 4,000 employees resulted in identifying 40 employees who were close to retirement and who had such unique knowledge and skills that needed to be transferred. While processes were put in place to capture their critical knowledge, the assessment also helped to identify knowledge back-ups that already existed.³⁰

²⁹ CPS Human Resource Services et al.

³⁰ The Center for Organizational Research et al.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Table of Contents

1	Purpose and Method	D-1
2	Summary of Findings – Citywide	D-2
3	Summary of Findings – By Employee Group.....	D-4
4	National Occupational Outlook	D-13
5	Summary Age & Length of Service Data by Group.....	D-16
6	Accounting Classes	D-16
7	Clerical Classes	D-18
8	IT Classes	D-20
9	Management Classes.....	D-22
10	Personnel Classes	D-24
11	Skilled Crafts Classes	D-27
12	Adult Probation Department	D-30
13	Fire Department	D-32
14	Human Services Agency.....	D-35
15	Juvenile Probation Department.....	D-37
16	Library.....	D-39
17	Municipal Transportation Agency	D-42
18	Police Department.....	D-44
19	Public Health Department.....	D-47
20	Public Utilities Commission	D-50
21	Recreation & Park Department.....	D-54
22	Additional WSP Efforts	D-56

1 Purpose and Method

This appendix summarizes preliminary HRIS data analysis and discussions with subject matter experts among 10 departments and six cross-departmental groups:

- Departments: Adult Probation Department, Fire Department, Human Services Agency, Juvenile Probation Department, Municipal Transportation Agency, Police Department, Department of Public Health, Library, Public Utilities Commission, Recreation & Park Department
- Cross-departmental groups: accounting, clerical, IT, management, personnel, and skilled crafts

Section 22. Additional WSP Efforts describes WSP efforts of three departments not included in the detailed analysis.

Departments and groups were chosen either because they serve an important function or because our FY 2006-07 Workforce Analysis indicated they had large numbers, or proportions of potential retirements. For each group an analysis of HRIS data and service retirement eligibility

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

projections by job class were prepared³¹ (see Appendix G. Sample Analysis) and sent with a cover memo (see Appendix H. Sample Memo) summarizing findings and asking interview participants to consider how changing demographics, technology, and other factors would affect services and workforce skills needed to deliver services.

The purposes of this preliminary review were:

- To compile and test the utility of basic, centrally-available data on employee demographics and retirement projections from the City's Human Resources Information System (HRIS) in identifying priority job classes or functions for workforce and succession planning efforts. Appendices E and F represent sample work products resulting from analyses of such data.
- To inform these data with input from managers on how changing demographics, technology, and other factors will affect services provided and skills needed in the next 3 to 10 years.
- To gauge departments' knowledge and or progress to date in workforce and succession planning activities, including ideas about strategies that could be used to address problems as they are currently understood.
- To summarize findings across departments and compare them to WSP trends in our literature review.

The review touches on some of the steps of workforce and succession planning described in Appendix B. Workforce and Succession Planning Model: context, work, demand, supply, gap analysis, priorities, and solutions. It includes a summary of HRIS data, interviews, and other sources for each employee group. *This analysis is not intended to take the place of departments' own completion of these steps. As discussed in report Section 4. Elements of Successful WSP Programs, accurate projections and skills gap determinations can only be done with the involvement of operational staff.*

2 Summary of Findings – Citywide

Based on the results of analyses of internal quantitative and qualitative data collected from databases, surveys, and interviews with staff throughout the City, which are described in, we identified the following trends and issues:

Operational Expertise is Required

Centrally-available data on employee demographics and retirement projections from the City's Human Resources Information System (HRIS) are useful in identifying high-level trends and retirement risk at the citywide and department levels, however, in the absence of operational expertise from departments, they are of limited use in identifying true risk at the job code level in ways that can lead to solutions. Detailed data about skills and training are not sufficiently captured in HRIS at this time to use in WSP.

³¹Data are from the City's HR Information System as of October 1, 2006 and exclude temporary exempt employees with as-needed schedules. Data represent employees at this point in time only. Citywide total and average figures exclude sworn members of the Police and Fire Departments.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Action Lags Behind Understanding

Both the City and its departments are like other employers in that they are increasingly aware of the importance of succession and workforce planning to their operations, but have not yet implemented programs to address their needs. Implementation persistently lags behind understanding. Most departments choose to address current over future problems, especially given budget processes and a political environment where it is difficult to sustain support for programs that take years to yield benefits.

One Size Does Not Fit All

Problems and solutions vary greatly among employee and skill groups. For some departments, high retirement risk among a group of employees is not a problem in itself; attrition may represent an opportunity to hire employees with the most current skills and service delivery approach needed to effectively serve the public. In these cases, the ability to quickly and effectively recruit and hire is more important than retention or knowledge management. In other cases, transferring knowledge of key individuals is the highest priority.

Balance is Important

Departments should seek a balance between internal and external promotions so they can retain knowledge about complex processes and also bring in new ideas and a positive attitude toward change. While promoting from within often yields high quality candidates who can operate effectively in the City environment, the City may sometimes overlook talented external candidates with a valuable diversity of experience and perspectives. In addition, hiring high quality employees from other departments will become less feasible as the talent pool shrinks.

Public Sector Work is Less Appealing

In general, fewer people entering the workforce display an interest in public service compared to their parents' generation. Of those that do, many seek work outside of government, in nonprofit and community-based organizations. This attitude, in combination with experience requirements for many positions, makes it harder for government organizations, including the City, to recruit new workers.

Recruitment is Insufficient

Although recruitment activities have increased in some areas, managers agree efforts are not proactive enough, and site staff shortages as the reason. Publicly posting positions and notifying interested individuals about openings is only the first step in recruiting. Despite decreased interest in public service among some worker groups, the City could effectively market itself as an employer of choice in terms of salary, health and retirement benefits, working conditions, public purpose, and work-life balance. In addition, staff in several departments said that compared to other jurisdictions, San Francisco is "behind the times" in adopting new industry standards and service delivery philosophies. This exacerbates recruitment problems.

A Variety of Approaches are Needed

In some cases, the problems are known and their solutions are relatively simple to implement, they just need to be better funded (e.g. supervisory and management skills training). In other

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

cases, solutions will need to be carefully design in order to succeed (e.g. apprenticeship programs). Many departments are reluctant to invest or participate in programs they perceive as unlikely to receive initial or ongoing support. Training efforts are commonly underfunded or viewed as an easy target for cuts, particularly in public sector organizations, and San Francisco is no exception.³²

3 Summary of Findings – By Employee Group

The following tables detail Current Issues and Trends, Current Strategies, and Possible Future Strategies for each department or employee group. Information in these tables is primarily based on interviews with City staff.

³² In FY 2005-06 budget discussions, over \$350,000 in training funds were recommended to be cut.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Current Issues and Industry Trends							
Dept / Group	Industry Context	Skills Needed	Retirement Risk	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management
Accounting Employees	Increased demand for accountants due to federal reporting standards and accounting scandals.	Computers have simplified basic tasks; other tasks more technical.	Higher among more senior levels, but addressed through 1649 Accounting Intern Program.	Not a problem.	Not currently a problem, though some employees may seek opportunity to earn CPA.	1649 Accounting Intern Program provides on-the-job professional training, standardized citywide.	Needed in a small number of cases.
Clerical Employees	Number of clerical jobs nationwide projected to continue declining due to automation, increased productivity.	Less data entry and clerical support, increased computer skills, document writing & editing, customer service.	High, but supply is adequate and demand decreasing.	Application volume is sufficient; some hiring managers seek more computer, customer service skills.	Generally not a problem.		Not a key issue.
IT Employees	Public and department expectations increase with changing technology. Technical skills constantly changing. Central IT departments becoming more consultative and customer-oriented.	Must constantly update technical skills. Also need supervision, management, project management, business process reengineering, and customer service skills.	Lower than citywide average; important among key individuals.	Insufficient in volume and speed to capture highest quality candidates in quick-moving job market. Need to identify and contact high potential individuals for certain projects.	Concern that there will be inadequate staff and skills in next 3-5 years.	Big issue. Technical skills must be constantly upgraded.	Key issue among certain individuals--those with knowledge about key processes and with key relationships.
Management Employees	Increased expectations of expert-level ability. Managers are increasingly seen as change agents, requiring leadership abilities.	Leadership, communication, and change management skills; political savvy; ability to attract and retain talent. In some fields, increased expectation of expert-level technical skills.	Slightly above average.	In competition with other government agencies and private sector for top candidates. Fewer in midcareer managers ranks means promising candidates promoted to high levels very quickly. Younger workers less willing to make personal sacrifices to reach executive levels.	Difficult with highly skilled employees, who are courted by other employers or departments.	MEA provides one-day seminars. Few departments have currently functioning leadership development programs, though many are interested. No citywide program.	Issue given complexity of existing systems.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Current Issues and Industry Trends							
Dept / Group	Industry Context	Skills Needed	Retirement Risk	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management
Personnel Employees	From model of transactional specialists to consultative, service-oriented HR generalists; more involved in organizational change.	Diversity of experience in HR functions, City-specific system knowledge; strong analytical, communication, judgment, and change management skills.	Very high--risk and actual retirements--at senior levels.	Need to balance internal and external hiring to maintain staffing and skill levels.	Generally not a problem, except for retirements. Departments often hire from other City departments.	Challenging; analysts need broad experience to be promotable, but organizational structure in large departments means analysts tend to specialize and remain in one job.	Key issue given complexity of existing systems, retirement of experienced staff, and move to generalist model.
Skilled Crafts Employees	Competition with utilities and construction. Projected growth in some areas (energy, transportation, automotive) and decline in others (machinists, laborers).	Math and technical aptitude. Nationwide, lowest skill jobs being eliminated.	Problem within specific groups.	Social emphasis on college degrees and white collar work hamper recruitment. Perception that decline in manufacturing means no jobs are available.	Not generally a problem.		Optimal for new employees to learn unique characteristics of City infrastructure from current employees.
ADP - Adult Probation Department	From criminal justice to field-based case management. Connect offenders to services. Evidence-based practices. From report writing to risk and needs assessment. Electronic files and reporting.	Case management, technology, communication, fitness for duty.	High among probation officers but does not threaten service delivery if hiring is timely.	No staff to conduct recruitment. Need to address.	Employees tend to stay with department. Cities, including SF, tend to lose to federal and state agencies that have higher pay/lower cost of living, & training opportunities.	Little training available; often low quality.	Not a key issue.
FIR - Fire Department	Incorporation of emergency medical services. Since 9/11 increased emphasis on early warning systems, information sharing, hazmat issues. Sworn staffing levels at stations determined by Administrative Code.	Leadership, management, medical.	High among both sworn and nonsworn personnel, but does not threaten service delivery.	Not an issue.	Many new hires from 1972-1974 are becoming retirement eligible. Turnover has increased in the past two decades.	Extensive and comparatively well funded. Increasingly involves technology-aided simulations.	Important for administrative command staff.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Current Issues and Industry Trends							
Dept / Group	Industry Context	Skills Needed	Retirement Risk	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management
HSA - Human Services Agency	More outreach and fieldwork requiring mobile devices and technical skills.	Language and basic computer skills. Less need for clerical skills.	High among certain groups, but does not threaten service delivery.	Needed for language skills.	Generally not a problem.	Need opportunities for clerical staff. Seek more promotional and leadership development opportunities.	Need to address at Program Manager level.
JUV - Juvenile Probation Department	Change from criminal justice/corrections to social work/rehabilitation. More youth of color with more violent offenses.	Social work, social justice, political science education and experience; diverse language and cultural skills.	High among certain groups, but not a problem.	Time to hire is important in recruiting college graduates. Expand recruitment	Generally not a problem.	Supervisory and management skills training.	Needed for administrative staff.
LIB - Library	Big changes in clientele, technology, and service delivery methods.	Language skills, supervisory skills, outward client focus, supervisory and leadership skills.	High among librarians and clerical staff but not a problem.	Direct competition with libraries nationwide for minority and bilingual MLIS graduates and those with leadership skills.	Generally not a problem.	Need supervisory, management, and leadership skills development.	Needed for those in specific leadership positions.
MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency	Less mechanical, more electronic vehicle components.	Transit-specific crafts skills, engineering, general supervisory and management skills.	Problem among select skilled crafts positions.	Recruitment is limited due to staff constraints. Competition for workers among other transit agencies and sometimes other City departments.	Excellent among skilled craftspeople; professionals tend to leave after 7-10 years. Engineering interns often leave for private sector pay and travel opportunities.	Many line staff promote to supervisory positions without training.	Not identified as an issue.
POL - Police Department	Increased used of technology for report writing, crime mapping and analysis. Staffing levels set by City Charter.	Technology, communication.	High among officers. Difficult for City to maintain mandated level of officers.	Dept has increased recruitment; DHR has increased number and frequency of exams, but still challenging as many other jurisdictions are also hiring.	Employees tend to stay with the department once hired, although in recent years, some officers have moved to smaller departments in the Bay Area.	Peace Officer Standards & Training (POST) set by state and mandatory for promotion; includes supervisory, management, and leadership training.	Not a big issue - procedures well-documented in general orders. But important to ensure new recruits work with experienced officers during all shifts.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Current Issues and Industry Trends							
Dept / Group	Industry Context	Skills Needed	Retirement Risk	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management
DPH - Department of Public Health	State-mandated staffing levels. Nationwide increase in use of health services. Move from paper to electronic records. LHH rebuild and HAP will have unknown effects on staffing models.	Basic computer skills. Ensuring high clinical skill levels among hires.	High among supervising nurses. Difficult to meet staffing needs.	Direct competition with private sector on wages, working conditions. Most difficult for RNs, radiology technicians, pharmacy staff.	Work environment and salary draw some staff to private hospitals, clinics and pharmacies.	Continuing education required for licensure for many employees.	Not a big issue - industry guidelines define SOPs and best practices.
PUC - Public Utilities Commission	WISP multibillion dollar capital program will require steady influx of new workers. Rapid technological change, increased emphasis on greening and conservation.	Current math, science, and engineering skills.	Problem among select skilled crafts positions.	Key issue, especially with professional classes. Competition with large private sector employers (oil, construction, manufacturing, utilities) requires recruitment and fast/easy process for applicants. Capital project deadlines require short time-to-hire.	Difficult among managers--may earn less than subordinates because of overtime restrictions or M CCP salary levels.	Hard to groom leaders in management classes if professional classes pay more. Need lead time craft development programs like leadership academies.	Needed in a small number of cases, including water quality lab.
REC - Recreation and Park Department	Recreation program content has changed significantly since the field was created. Focus on health lifestyles, innovative programs.	Technology, facilitation, negotiation, knowledge of both recreation and parks.	High among certain groups, but not a problem.	Need faster hiring processes that identify higher quality candidates.	Generally not a problem.	Need to hire and train recreation and park professionals rather than specialists in certain areas. Need more opportunity for career mobility.	Needed in a small number of cases, particularly for maintenance.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Current WSP Strategies					
Dept / Group	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management	Other/Business Processes
Accounting Employees	1649 Accounting Intern Program		1649 Accounting Intern Program		
Clerical Employees	DHR piloting new testing software; customer service, filing, and basic math skills modules to be incorporated.				
IT Employees	Part time recruiter hired to help address critical staffing needs.				GSA conducting assessment of DTIS to determine WSP needs and skills gap. DTIS internal consulting group developing new project management process.
Management Employees		Under Prop F, retired employees may work up to 960 hours per fiscal year.	DHR training, including 24 PLUS training for supervisors and managers; Increase in MOU reimbursements for conferences, travel, and tuition.	Formal program at BOS for all staff, including managers, to document policies and procedures for all job functions and cross-train staff.	Varies by department.
Personnel Employees			Piloting HR training program with SFSU.	Documenting HR policies and procedures.	
Skilled Crafts Employees	Participate in union apprenticeship programs for utility plumbers and stationary engineers.		Participate in union apprenticeship programs for utility plumbers and stationary engineers.		
ADP - Adult Probation Department			Chief is on statewide probation training task force to improve the quality of trainers and training.	Reviewing and updating procedures manual.	Employee survey on educational background found employees are well educated (including psychology and social science degrees), but not applying background to jobs.
FIR - Fire Department			Increased training using simulations.		Developing strategic plan, including possible regional training center.
HSA - Human Services Agency	Increased recruitment of bilingual candidates.		Computer and technical training skills offered, encouraged. 3-month induction program.		Succession planning manager identified.
JUV - Juvenile Probation Department	Department will reinstate physical agility test in hiring.	Acting supervisors permanent by working with DHR on exam production.			

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Current WSP Strategies					
Dept / Group	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management	Other/Business Processes
LIB - Library	Conducts nationwide recruitment for some positions. Recruitment materials provide detailed housing and transportation information.		Training Manual and Program for all employees.		Participates in industry association efforts in leadership development and diversity.
MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency	9916 trainee program recruits and trains local residents for maintenance and other tasks, and helps them meet MQs for other positions. Staff assist entry-level job applicants navigate the application process.				
POL - Police Department	Expanded advertising, monthly testing which consolidates multiple parts of the exam process. Referral bonuses for current employees and lateral hires.	More regular promotional exams, retirement enhancement for long-term employees.	Experienced officer night premium to provide training and leadership for new officers.		
DPH - Department of Public Health	Training programs. Targeted compensation, including premiums for certain shifts and specialty areas. Close monitoring of vacancy rates in certain classifications, such as Registered Nurse. Prioritizing requisitions for 24/7 clinical positions.	Salary surveys; targeted compensation, including retention bonuses for jobs with high vacancy rates; educational funds. LHH did confidential survey of employees to gauge possible retirements.	Outside funding for RN clinical skills improvement training. MOU - City has become member of the SEIU UHW Joint Employer Education Fund. Employees can take classes to do skills training, career counseling/upgrade.		
PUC - Public Utilities Commission	Increased recruitment at job fairs and posting on a wider variety of websites. 9910 stationary engineer pre-apprentice program helps prepare residents for apprenticeship programs. Have both utility plumber and stationary engineer apprentices.		Health and safety training available to all employees. Targeted training for certain groups, including presentation skills for engineers. Will hire a training consultant to develop training plans.	Participating in pilot knowledge management programs run by trade associations.	Full time Workforce and Planning and Development Team developing a plan and timeline to identify high vulnerability classes. Divisions developing 10 year capital plans, which will help identify staffing needs and strategies. HR meets weekly with operations managers to discuss hiring plans.
REC - Recreation and Park Department	Increase recruitment through industry websites.		Align with industry standards in promoting professionalization in the recreation and park field, particularly among managers, such as the new Neighborhood Services Managers.	Automating facilities management and recreation management software.	

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Possible Future WSP Strategies					
Dept / Group	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management	Other/Business Processes
Accounting Employees			Review options for employees to earn CPAs.		
Clerical Employees			DHR developing a training course for Microsoft Word, proof-reading and editing skills.		
IT Employees			Plan to focus on upgrading employee technical and soft skills, including performance management and supervisory skills training.	Assessment will identify key individuals and areas for knowledge management and transfer.	
Management Employees			DHR developing citywide leadership development program.		
Personnel Employees	Create an internship program similar to that for accountants to bring in high potential employees and teach them City processes.			Need knowledge transfer for particular employees.	Retirement and implementation of new integrated HR/payroll system likely to drive simplification of processes.
Skilled Crafts Employees	Expanded apprenticeship programs.		Expanded apprenticeship programs.		
ADP - Adult Probation Department	Create a recruitment program and materials.		Find training resources so employees can change service delivery model.		Modernize practices - risk and needs assessment, field work, technology, social services. Begin verifying addresses of parolees and transferring cases to other jurisdictions.
FIR - Fire Department				Groom operational staff to take on administrative functions - have overlap, knowledge sharing.	
HSA - Human Services Agency	Reduce barriers to efficient and effective hiring.		Human Services Certificate Program; Management academy for mid-managers and supervisors. Participate in UC Davis Leadership program series. Admin Pro clerical training series.		

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Possible Future WSP Strategies					
Dept / Group	Recruitment & Hiring	Retention	Training/Career Development	Knowledge Management	Other/Business Processes
JUV - Juvenile Probation Department	Reduce time to hire by speeding background checks, perhaps in collaboration with other departments. Create part time, TEX positions for college students that allow them to qualify for permanent positions upon graduation.		Increase training for supervisors and managers.		
LIB - Library	Need mechanisms to recruit and retain a more diverse workforce.		Seeking to develop a Leadership Training Academy to teach supervisory and management skills.	Knowledge transfer and mentoring at leadership levels.	
MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency	Proposed Transit Academy will work with school district and unions to encourage high school students to remain in school and consider transit careers when they graduate.		Participate in apprenticeship programs. Require management training for line workers to promote, tracked in performance evaluations.		
POL - Police Department	Promote Police Cadet Program.				
DPH - Department of Public Health	Expand Pipeline/Training programs.	Mentoring programs.	Increase staff capacity to obtain private funding for nurse training programs.		
PUC - Public Utilities Commission	Expand recruitment efforts. Work with local schools to promote careers in skilled trades.		Establish apprenticeship programs, through unions or independently, in high need areas. Create career development plans for all employees for skills training and retention. Electronic Instrumentation degree program.	Knowledge capture from select group of employees, done by operational staff. Risk Assessment Application has been developed to evaluate the possibility of knowledge loss due to turnover from at-risk classes and positions.	
REC - Recreation and Park Department	Create more efficient and effective hiring processes.				

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

4 National Occupational Outlook

The U.S. Department of Labor Bureau of Labor Statistics provides employment projections through 2014 in its Occupational Outlook Handbook. While the local labor market may differ from the national labor market and ultimately have greater impact on the City's ability to hire and retain employees, the City is affected by these trends.

High Growth Industries

The first table below shows growth in five high growth industries in which the City employs workers and in which there may be greater competition for workers. High growth industries are considered "economically critical, projected to add substantial numbers of new jobs, and are being transformed by technology and innovation."³³ Health care, homeland security, and information technology have occupations which are projected to grow much faster than average; financial services and construction, transportation, automotive and energy have occupations that will grow faster than average.

³³ O*NET Online Directory of National High Growth Industries. <http://online.onetcenter.org/find/indemand>

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Projected Rate of Job Growth in High Growth Industries, 2004-2014

Industry	Much Faster Than Average	Faster Than Average	Average	Slower Than Average
Construction Transportation Automotive & Energy		construction and building inspectors, environmental engineers	mechanics, automotive service technicians, carpenters, plumbers, electricians, operating engineers, painters, cement masons, sheet metal workers, roofers, glaziers, structural iron and steel workers, bus drivers	welders, machinists, laborers
Financial Services		accountants, auditors, computer support specialists, IS managers, actuaries	financial managers, claims adjustors, payroll clerks, budget analysts	accounting clerks, claims clerks
Health Care	home health aides, medical assistants, physical therapists, physician assistants	registered nurses, pharmacy technicians, pharmacists, radiologic technologists, lab technicians, EMTs, paramedics, medical records/health information technicians, mental health/substance abuse social workers, mental health counselors, medical and public health social workers	licensed practical and vocational nurses, dentists, dieticians, occupational health and safety specialists	psychiatric technicians
Homeland Security	software engineers (applications), network systems and data communications analysts, network/system administrators, computer security specialists, database administrators	computer systems analysts, fire fighters, EMTs, paramedics, emergency management specialists, epidemiologists	security guards, police and sheriff's patrol officers, detectives and criminal investigators, police/fire/ambulance dispatchers	computer programmers, chemists, operations research analysts, statisticians
Information Technology	software engineers (applications), network systems and data communications analysts, network/system administrators, database administrators	computer systems analysts, IS managers,		computer programmers

Source: compiled from data available at ONET, <http://online.onetcenter.org>

Occupational Outlook for Selected Employee Groups

The next table shows projected job growth in the professions selected for our detailed analysis. It is important to note that national job growth may not be reflected in the local labor market, and that the number of job opportunities may be more or less than growth rates would suggest. For example, while the projected growth rate for librarians is slower than average, there will be good

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

job opportunities due to large expected retirements, fewer people entering the field, and increased use of librarians by companies who seek their research and organizational skills.

Job Growth in Selected Areas

Dept / Group	Projected Rate of Job Growth
Accounting Employees	Faster than average due to increased scrutiny, changes in financial reporting standards, accounting scandals.
Clerical Employees	Slower than average growth overall, decline in some service areas, due to increasing productivity and automation.
IT Employees	Faster than average overall due to increased use of computer applications; slower than average for entry-level programmers, as new software can write basic code; much faster than average for systems and database administrators as organizations increasingly rely on sophisticated systems.
Management Employees	Faster than average for HR, training, and labor relations due to increasing government labor standards and court rulings, increasing training needs, increasing recruitment, and awareness of need to manage talent for success. Faster than average for computer and IS managers due to technological advancements. Average for financial managers due to regulatory reforms tempered by corporate downsizing. Average for construction and engineering managers.
Personnel Employees	Faster than average due to increased need for recruitment, training, development, compensation expertise; fastest among management and consulting firms as companies increasingly outsource and as employment is sensitive to downsizing.
Skilled Crafts Employees	Faster than average for construction and building inspectors; average for mechanics, automotive service technicians, carpenters, plumbers, electricians, operating engineers, painters, cement masons, sheet metal workers, roofers, and glaziers; slower than average for welders, machinists, and laborers.
ADP - Adult Probation Department	Average; mandatory sentencing guidelines being reconsidered in many states may increase demand for alternatives such as probation, however, outlook heavily dependent on political trends and government funding.
FIR - Fire Department	Faster than average in suburban areas as volunteer forces become professional.
HSA - Human Services Agency	Much faster than average for human services assistants serving elderly population; faster than average for social workers due to aging population and trend toward placing substance abusers in treatment programs instead of prison. Faster than average for employment counselors to assist beneficiaries of welfare programs who exhaust their eligibility and must find jobs.
JUV - Juvenile Probation Department	Average for probation officers (see ADP).
LIB - Library	Slower than average due to budget constraints, increased access to information via computer, and trend toward hiring less costly library technicians and assistants.
MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency	Average for subway and streetcar operators due to increased demand for light-rail systems; faster than average for local transit bus drivers due to increasing popularity of mass transit in urban areas;
POL - Police Department	Average; increased security-consciousness and concern about drug-related crimes tempered by reductions in federal grants to local police departments.
DPH - Department of Public Health	Faster than average due to aging population and increased demand for services. Highest among occupations providing services to older populations, such as home health aides and physical therapists.
PUC - Public Utilities Commission	Average for architects, where employment is sensitive to demand for certain specialties; average for civil engineers; much faster than average for environmental engineers to comply with environmental regulations. All sensitive to changes in economy and offshoring.
REC - Recreation and Park Department	Average; increased spending of time and money on recreation, especially by retiring baby boomers tempered by local government budget constraints. Greater growth in nursing and residential care facilities, and in social organizations.
Source: Compiled from data available at http://www.bls.gov/oco	

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

5 Summary Age & Length of Service Data by Group

Functional Groups - Average Age and Length of Service (LOS)

Functional Group	Total EEs	Average Age	Average LOS
Accounting	233	49.4	15.8
Clerical	1,058	49.7	13.8
Information Technology	704	47.4	11.8
Management	811	50.5	13.6
Personnel	192	47.8	13.4
Skilled Crafts ^a	1,593	50.4	14.5
ADULT PROBATION	103	47.6	14.4
FIRE DEPARTMENT (miscellaneous employees)	97	49.9	15.7
FIRE DEPARTMENT (sworn employees)	1,602	43.4	13.9
HUMAN SERVICES AGENCY	1,820	47.1	11.8
JUVENILE PROBATION	243	49.3	16.2
MTA - MUNICIPAL RAILWAY	4,729	49.6	13.6
POLICE (miscellaneous employees)	337	49.1	15.5
POLICE (sworn employees)	2,172	43.3	16.3
PUBLIC HEALTH	5,908	47.7	12.5
PUBLIC LIBRARY	701	45.5	13.6
PUBLIC UTILITIES	1,924	48.5	13.1
RECREATION & PARK	848	48.5	15.9
Total Miscellaneous Employees Citywide	23,906		
Miscellaneous, Average Age, Average LOS		47.9	12.7
Total Sworn Employees Citywide	3,774		
Sworn, Average Age, Average LOS		43.3	16.3
Source: HR Information System			
Note: ^a Employees represented by Local 6 Electrical Workers, Local 38 Plumbers, and Local 39			

6 Accounting Classes

The 233 employees included in this job series include employees in classes 1649, 1650, 1652, 1654, 1655, 1656, and 1657, spanning 31 departments.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average City employee performing accounting functions citywide is 49.4 years old and has 15.8 years of service.
- The largest age group is 55-64 (35.6%), which varies from the Citywide average of 36.2% in the 45-54 age group. The largest LOS group is 5-9 (25.8%), which is a lower percentage than the citywide average of 29.8% for the same age group.
- 52.4% of employees are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 39.9% are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 16.7% are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is higher than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- Currently, there seems to be high retirement risk in the following job classes:
 - 1652- Senior Accountant- 39% of employees in this class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits, with 20% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 53% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 31% likely to retire soon.
 - 1654- Principal Accountant- 43% of employees in this class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits, with 17% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 61% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 33% likely to retire soon.
 - 1657- Senior Systems Accountant- 51% of employees in this class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits, with 16% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 64% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 43% likely to retire soon.

Qualitative Research Summary

- The U.S. Department of Labor projects employment for accountants to grow faster than average in the next seven years, due to changes in financial reporting standards, a number of high profile accounting scandals, and other factors. Computer programs will continue to simplify basic accounting tasks, leaving accountants available to perform more technical and complex tasks.³⁴

In 1997 the Controller's Office, in cooperation with departments, created the 1649 Accountant Intern Program to address the inability to recruit and retain highly skilled accountants who could understand and maintain the City's finances. Given the lack of organized training and regular performance feedback, there were inconsistencies with respect to ability and performance, and some felt exams did not adequately test what was necessary to perform well and stay updated in the field.

- To take the program entrance exam, applicants must have a degree from an accredited college or university with at least 12 semester units or 18 quarter hours in accounting or a closely related field. The exam tests basic knowledge and application of Generally Accepted Accounting Principles (GAAP) and some governmental accounting.
- Participants receive hands-on training during two 9-month rotations in City departments which prepare them with the skills needed to transition into the 1652 Senior Accountant

³⁴ O*NET Online Directory of National High Growth Industries. <http://online.onetcenter.org/find/indemand>

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

class. There are monthly meetings in which program participants to learn presentation and writing skills.

- Departments contact the Controller when accountant staff turnover is expected. The only way departments can hire into the 1652 position is through lateral hires or by sponsoring an intern.
- Departments pay intern salaries and training costs, and provide mentors and supervisors for the interns; since no department has dedicated trainers, staff serve in these roles in addition to their normal responsibilities. The Controller's Office Director of Administration and Departmental Personnel Officer administer and oversee the program, with assistance from clerical staff. In addition to screening and testing applicants and making intern placements, they interact with departments to ensure departments maintain experiential learning standards and that the training assignments are challenging. Finally, a Steering Committee of fiscal management staff from the Controller's Office and various departments sets policy, oversees exam and curricula, conducts intern entrance, rotation, and graduation interviews, and approves graduation from the program.
- The program is advertised on the Controller's Office website and through local colleges, but is most highly promoted through word of mouth. The department currently has a list of 110 individuals who have requested to participate in the next exam.
- One key to the program is that interns have permanent exempt status and can be removed at any time if they are not performing well and/or the host department indicates they will not hire the intern permanently. Interns earn a relatively low salary but receive professional training and a well-paid, permanent position upon graduation.
- Program administrators emphasize that using the program as a model for other professional classes, such as the 1241 Personnel Analyst class, would require participation and support from other departments to ensure the quality of rotational assignments. It would require the lead department to commit staff consistently over time, and would require formation of a committed and knowledgeable steering committee. The 1649 Program has succeeded in part because Steering Committee members help with program development and dedicate several days to interviews for each program cycle.
- The 1649 entrance exam has been given ten times since the Program began. Approximately 130 interns have graduated from the program (excluding the current class of 15 interns), and of those, approximately 40 have already promoted from the 1652 Senior Accountant classes into higher level classes such as 1654 Principal Accountant, 1657 Senior Systems Accountant, and 1823 Senior Administrative Analyst. The program is credited for helping to increase standard skill levels and expectations in the accountant series.

7 Clerical Classes

There are dozens of job codes that are considered clerical. For the purposes of this review, we limited our analysis to the clerk typist (1424, 1426), secretary (1444, 1446), and executive secretary (1450, 1452, 1454) classes, which were surveyed by DHR in November 2006.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Quantitative Research Summary

- Within the City, there are 1,058 employees working in these classes with an average age 49.7 years and average length of service of 13.8 years.
- The largest age group is 45-54 (37.20%), similar to the Citywide average of 36.2% in the same group. The largest LOS group is 5-9 years (33.7%), which is a higher percentage than the citywide average of 29.8% for the same age group.
- Almost half of clerical employees (49.1%) are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 25.3% are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 5.7% are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is higher than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- Currently, there seems to be high retirement risk in the following job classes:
 - 1426- Senior Clerk Typist- 43% of employees in the job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 57% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits.
 - 1452- Executive Secretary II- 38% of employees in the job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 75% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 25% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Survey and Qualitative Data Summary

- Clerical positions have historically been an entry point for workers new to the City. Job duties have evolved from data entry and clerical support to computer document management, document writing and editing, and customer service.
- While retirement risk among this group is relatively high, adequate supply and decreasing demand mean it does not pose an operational risk for most departments. In this way, the City reflects nationwide trends in clerical employment due to increasing productivity and automation: seven of the eleven occupations with the largest projected numerical decreases in employment between 2004-2014 are clerical occupations: stock clerks; file clerks; order clerks; mail clerks; computer operators; secretaries (excluding legal, medical, and executive); and word processors and typists.³⁵
- In May 2006, DHR's Recruitment and Assessment Services group surveyed departments on the Clerical Testing Program. Feedback about ways to improve the pool of candidates and relevance of testing was received from 28 departments. Seventy percent of survey respondents felt the Program provided an adequate pool of candidates; the remainder felt that candidates needed stronger customer service skills, skills with a variety of computer applications (including Excel, Powerpoint, and Access), and the ability learn department-specific procedures quickly.

³⁵ Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2006-07 Edition. U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- In November 2006, DHR's Workforce Development group surveyed employees in clerk typist and secretary classes (as above) in order to improve the testing process and develop training options. The response rate was 22%, and responses were received from employees in 29 departments. Employees answered questions about the knowledge, skills, and abilities needed for their job classes, as well as their experience with the clerical testing process, as follows:
 - 93% agreed that the clerical testing program assesses the knowledge, skills, and abilities needed for their job classes.
 - Respondents agreed that the test should assess spelling and grammar (81%), file management skills (75%), customer service skills (74%), and vocabulary knowledge (72%).
 - Other skills that should be assessed include basic math (66%), formatting (62%), and software applications (53%). A variety of software applications were listed.
 - 70% of respondents agreed that typing speed is important for quantity of workload and responsibilities. Others responded that typing speed is not as important as accuracy, computer literacy, and the ability to edit documents; that typing speed does not measure productivity levels; and speed is not important if there are no deadlines. The top reason provided for not passing the clerical exam was the typing score.
 - The top reason provided for not being hired off the registry was that the employee had not been interested in the positions offered or available. Additional reasons included that positions were intended for an existing candidate, that there was a freeze on exams, and that lists expired within a short time period.
 - Employees stated that over 50% of their duties include front counter work, phone contact, securing messengers, and other responsibilities from payroll to web liaison to building maintenance and repairs.

DHR has considered or implemented the following programs to prepare for the future:

- In February 2007, DHR piloted new testing software, including supplemental questionnaires and new testing modules. The software currently tests the same skills as before—typing speed, proofreading, and MS Word proficiency—but will soon incorporate modules to test customer service, filing, and basic math skills as well.
- As part of City University's effort to provide career development of City employees, DHR is developing a training course for employees in the clerical series that will incorporate computer training in Microsoft Word as well as proof-reading and editing skills. Lastly, employees in all job classes may also take English as Second Language written and oral skills classes offered through City University.

8 IT Classes

The 704 employees included in this job group include employees in the IT series (classes 1002 - 1071) and managers listed in the Management Classification and Compensation Plan (MCCP) database under the functional area of information services.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average City employee performing IT functions citywide is 47.4 years old and has 11.8 years of service.
- The largest age group is 45-54 (33.1%), lower than the Citywide average of 36.2% in the same group. The largest LOS group is 5-9 (36.1%), which is a higher percentage than the citywide average of 29.8% for the same age group.
- 35.8% are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is lower than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 17.8% are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is lower than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 3.6% are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is lower than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- Currently, there seems to be high retirement risk in the following job classes:
 - 1053- IS Business Analyst Senior- 21% of employees in the job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 41% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits.
 - Programmer Analyst series (1062-1064)- Over 25% of employees in the job group is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, almost 40% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits.
 - 1071 IS Manager- 42% of employees in the job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 69% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 25% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

- The rapid pace of change in information technology means that skills must constantly be updated. The benchmark used in the private sector is that skills must be updated every 18 months to remain relevant. In the City, the benchmark is closer to three years. When the City can not hire or train for new skills quickly enough, it must turn to contractors to deliver key projects on time, reducing professional development opportunities for employees.
- Given the rapid pace of change, traditional recruitment methods (e.g. posting openings) do not work to hire those with the most recent and high quality skills. Hiring managers need to identify and contact promising individuals quickly or risk losing them to other employers. Recruitment needs to occur at the individual level. Overall, recruitment efforts need to be expanded and modified significantly.
- Overall, the City is behind in meeting public expectations for web-based information and transactions. IT functions have become more decentralized as departments seek solutions faster than DTIS or groups of departments can implement citywide or shared systems. Some current areas of high interest are citywide wi-fi, CRM, GIS and mapping, and web-based transaction systems.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Given decentralization and rapid change, centralized IT departments need to become more consultative and responsive to customer needs. For DTIS, this includes developing a customer service orientation and skills.
- As in many other areas, the City tends to hire experienced candidates, rather than new graduates from computer science or electrical engineering programs. Layoffs in recent years eliminated some of the newest hires with the most recent skills.
- There is variation in skills and abilities among IT staff in departments, and interest in increasing standards (through degree requirements, etc.) and applying them consistently across departments, especially for critical positions such as 1053 Senior Business Analysts and 1071 IS Managers.

DTIS and GSA have considered or are implementing the following programs to prepare for the future:

- In the coming months, GSA's Training and Development Team will conduct an assessment of current skills and needs at DTIS to shape recruitment, hiring, training, and knowledge management activities. In addition to collecting and reviewing turnover data, GSA will survey staff and managers on current skills and future skills needed and conduct a gap analysis. The assessment will help identify employees to participate in knowledge management and documentation efforts.
- DTIS has created an internal consulting group to develop criteria for selecting projects, and then to design, develop, and manage new projects in coordination with operational staff.
- DTIS has hired a part-time technical recruiter to help identify and recruit high potential individuals for short-term critical needs.
- Since 2004, DTIS has increased the amount of managerial and supervisory training provided to staff.

9 Management Classes

Citywide there are 811 employees represented by the Municipal Executives Association; some of these managers are also included in sections on Personnel and IT classes. Many organizations focus their workforce planning efforts on manager groups similar to this because, on average, they are closer to retirement than other groups, and because they perform work that is critical to their organizations.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average employee in this group is 50.5 years old and has 13.6 years of service.
- The largest age group is 45-54 (36.9%), similar to the Citywide average of 36.2% in the same group. The largest LOS group is 5-9 (28.4%), which is a slightly lower percentage than the citywide average of 29.8% for the same age group.
- 48.6% are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 26.9% are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 20.9%. In five years, 46.9% will be eligible for service retirement.
- 4.3% are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is similar than the citywide average of 4.4%.

Qualitative Research Summary

The key workforce development drivers among this group of employees are:

- Increased expectations of expert-level technical ability due to increasing pay rates and reductions in support staff. For example, employers increasingly seek candidates with law degrees for their top HR positions. Given changes in demographics and technology, and their effect on services, managers are increasingly seen as change agents, requiring leadership skills.
- Many organizations thinned their middle management ranks in the 1980s and 1990s. This reduced the pool now available to move into senior management and is leading to the recent phenomenon of intelligent and motivated individuals with little management experience being promoted quickly to high levels of management.
- As the number of experienced management candidates dwindles, it will become important to be able to qualify candidates based on measurement of competencies. One of the most important skills to seek among managers will be the ability to find and attract talent.
- It is not clear how well the City will be able to retain managers near retirement age. More people are working beyond traditional retirement age due to improvements in health and life expectancy, inadequate savings, and enjoyment of work. The national shift toward defined contribution pension plans is commonly blamed for decreased financial security and increased workforce participation rates among workers aged 55-65,³⁶ however, since the City still provides a defined benefit pension, its employees are more likely to be able to afford to retire. They will defer retirement, or work part time after retirement, only if they have more control in deciding when, where, how much and on what to work. The City may therefore benefit more by focusing on recruitment and development efforts.
- Recruitment may be difficult. Surveys indicate younger workers are less willing than baby boomers to sacrifice family and other non-work interests for career advancement, and are likely to view executive positions as undesirable because of the long hours and pressures from numerous, disparate stakeholders.³⁷

Entities across the City have developed various strategies for management employees:

³⁶ Anderson Garcia, Alissa. 2007. More Californians are Working Later in Life. *Policy Points*. California Budget Project. April.

³⁷ Preparing the Next Generation: A Guide for Current and Future Local Government Managers. 2003. International City/County Management Association (ICMA) Edited by Frank Benest.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Many have considered mentoring programs. For example, HSA plans to restart their Mentoring Towards Success Program, in which approximately 15 HSA employees per year learn about a variety of HSA programs, develop operational and management skills, and work with the executive management team in completing a predefined project. Participants will develop supportive, professional relationships with senior members of the agency management team.
- DHR is developing a Citywide leadership training program which will target department managers to become senior managers in the City.
- Many departments take advantage of Prop F, which allows them to bring back employees after retirement on a part-time basis. For knowledge management purposes, several departments have suggested developing a process by which departments can bring on successors to high-level management positions before the incumbent retires.
- The MEA contract includes monthly one-day seminars presented by the Institute for Management Studies on leadership topics identified through an annual needs assessment of member organizations.

10 Personnel Classes

The 192 employees included in this job group include employees in the Personnel series (classes 1241, 1244, 1246, and 1270) and managers listed in the Management Classification and Compensation Plan (MCCP) under the functional area of human resources. In order to provide meaningful retirement projections, DHR selected these MCCP positions to include in this analysis, because there is a natural career progression for human resources professionals to promote into management and continue the work of human resource management.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average City employee performing human resource functions citywide is 47.8 years old and has 13.4 years of service.
- The largest age group is 45-54 (34.0%), similar to the Citywide average of 36.2% in the same group. The largest LOS group is 5-9 (38.2%), which is a higher percentage than the citywide average of 29.8% for the same age group.
- 44.3% are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 19.3% are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is slightly lower than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 4.7% are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is similar than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- Currently, there seems to be high retirement risk in the following job classes:

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 1246- Principal Personnel Analyst- 43% of employees in this class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 57% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits.
- 0932- Manager IV- 38% of employees in this class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 75% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 25% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

The key workforce development drivers in the human resources (HR) function are:

- Over the past 20 years the field has shifted from “personnel,” with its focus on rules, processes, and documentation, to “human resources,” focused on achieving organizational goals. DHR staff report an increase in the number of requests from departments to provide advice on organizational structure and change.
- In the past ten years, many jurisdictions, including San Francisco, have modified their model of HR service delivery from using specialists to process transactions (testing applicants, creating eligible lists, classifying positions, administering claims) to using HR generalists who assist in all of these areas, and also interpret rules to advise client departments on the best options to address their staffing needs. The need, as in many other fields, is for HR generalists with strong analytical and writing skills and the ability to learn quickly.
- Some HR managers contend that the problem is not a lack of qualified candidates in the local labor market, but rather the City’s lackluster recruitment of them. Government has not marketed itself as an employer of choice to college students, despite its competitiveness in terms of salary, benefits, stability, potential for work-life balance, and the psychic rewards of public service. Some managers feel that since HR managers in the City report to a department’s appointing officer, and have no relationship to the City’s HR Director, departments compete with each other for limited resources rather than cooperating to increase the pool of qualified candidates.
- Managers generally agree that diversity of training and experience is key in keeping human resources functioning effectively. The City needs both employees who understand its unique HR systems and processes, as well as employees from other organizations, public or private, with new ideas and perspectives. Public sector human resources is more regulated and complex than in the private sector, and many departments prefer to hire HR staff from other departments who are familiar with these procedures. However, while City experience is both valuable and necessary, the City may be missing out on talented individuals who can move the field forward. In addition, at the management level, hiring high quality employees from other departments will become less feasible as the talent pool shrinks.
- HR managers see pros and cons to increasing retirements, and there is disagreement over the risk retirements pose. While DHR and other departments want to capture the institutional knowledge of these employees, and would like to delay their retirement or retain them part time, they also see retirements as an opportunity to change business practices. In addition, they recognize the loss is not simply of knowledge, but of people

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

who understand the purpose and value of public sector HR work: equal opportunity, access to public employment, hiring the best qualified employees, and professionalism inspired by the impact HR has in employees' lives and City services.

DHR has considered or implemented the following programs to prepare for the future:

- As part of City University, the career development initiative implemented this fiscal year, DHR is working with San Francisco State University's College of Extended Learning to customize their Human Resource certificate to focus on enhancing professional skills and including more City-specific content that promotes HR generalist content knowledge. DHR seeks to pilot the curriculum in stages beginning in the next few months with consulting, management, and influence skills training.
- Knowledge management is important, not only because of increasing retirements, but because of the inconsistency in procedures among departments. DHR's Client Services Division is updating its Human Resources Policies and Procedures manual to clarify and consolidate existing procedures. The \$20 million HR Information System upgrade project currently underway will provide substantial opportunity to document and improve business processes in the next three years. Staff are aware that while improved management of explicit knowledge (e.g. Civil Service Rules) through data storage and documentation are crucial, there is also a need to pass on tacit knowledge (e.g. how Civil Service Rules are applied in an examination or how they would have to be changed to modify hiring practices) to new employees.
- Minimum qualifications for the 1241 Personnel Analyst, the entry level class in the professional personnel series, were broadened in the past year in an effort to remove barriers to entry and create a promotive line into the analyst series. The class once required a college degree and one year related work experience. The degree requirement can now be substituted with four years' work experience in the personnel area. The change has received mixed reviews to date. Many employees in the clerical personnel and payroll classes (1202, 1204, 1220, 1222, 1224) applied to and were put on the 1241 registry because they met the minimum qualifications. However, some hiring managers contend these applicants do not possess the analytical thinking, independent judgment, communication, and persuasive writing skills needed to perform.
- To speed the transition to the HR generalist model, DHR has considered a number of options including rotating employees among different functional divisions in DHR, creating a year-long fellowship program for college students to work in different HR fields, and rotating staff among City departments (much as the 1649 Accounting Intern program at the Controller's Office places interns in departments). These ideas have not yet been implemented for a number of reasons, chiefly competing priorities for staff time, and the reluctance to lose the investment of staff time in a person who might leave. Another reason cited is the lack of standardization among departments in their HR functions, so that departments prefer to train and hire their own HR staff. Still, there is agreement among HR managers across the City that the 1649 Accounting Intern program provides a strong model that should be seriously considered for Personnel Analysts.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

11 Skilled Crafts Classes

Quantitative Research Summary - Plumber, Electrician, and Stationary Engineer Classes

This section provides analysis of three of the largest crafts unions:

Skilled Crafts Employees - Demographics & Retirement Eligibility				
	Electrical Workers, Local 6	Plumbers, Local 38	Stationary Engineers, Local 39	Citywide
Number of Employees	731	309	553	
Average Age	51	48	51	47.9
Average Length of Service	15	15	14	12.7
Retirement				
Eligible for Vesting Ret.	56%	40%	52%	41.0%
Eligible for Service Ret.	33%	20%	26%	21.0%
Likely to Elect Service Ret.	9%	4%	3%	4.4%
Eligible for Service Ret. in 5 years	54%	48%	54%	41.0%
Likely to Elect Service Ret. in 5 years	21%	10%	11%	11.7%
Source: HR Information System				

- Electrical Workers, Local 6. Between FY 2001-02 and FY 2005-06, the average age of new hires was 42.6 years. 54% of separations were retirements, with an average age of 60.8, and 43% were resignations, with an average of 49.2
- Plumbers, Local 38. Between FY 2001-02 and FY 2005-06, the average age of new hires was 36.6 years. Half of separations were retirements, with an average age of 59.8, and 43% were resignations, with an average of 50.
- Stationary Engineers, Local 39. Between FY 2001-02 and FY 2005-06, the average age of new hires was 44. Retirements comprised 47% of separations, with an average age of 60.6, and 52% were resignations, with an average of 50.9.

Quantitative Research Summary - Apprenticeship Classes

The City currently employs skilled crafts apprentices in four job classes. The table below shows employee counts in these job classes as of October 1, 2006.

- 7333 Apprentice Stationary Engineer. As of October 1, 2006, there were 36 individuals in this class. Only one apprentice in this class was not previously a City employee in another class. DPW apprentices were all formerly Bridgetenders, and promoted to this class in September, 2004. Apprentices in other departments were promoted from a variety of lower-skilled or lower paying positions such as General Laborer, Custodian, Porter, Museum Guard, Assistant Recreation Director, and Public Service Aide. On average, apprentices are 43 years of age and have 11 years of service with the City. Apprentices have been in this class for at most two years and nine months.
- 7339 Apprentice Stationary Engineer, Water Treatment Plant. As of October 1, 2006, there were four employees in this class. Two were newly hired as apprentices, and two were promoted from General Laborers. The average age is 35 years, and average length

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

of service is three years. Apprentices have been in this class for at most two years and nine months.

- 7375 Apprentice Stationary Engineer, Sewage Plant. As of October 1, 2006, there were 18 employees in this class. Three were newly hired as apprentices, and the rest were promoted from a variety of classes including Gardener, Clerk, Environmental Service Worker, General Laborer, Truck Driver, and Public Service Aide. The average age is 39 years, and average length of service is seven years. Apprentices have been in this class for at most three years.
- 7463 Utility Plumber Apprentice. As of October 1, 2006, there were 23 employees in this class. Seventeen were newly hired as apprentices, and the remainder were promoted from General Laborer positions. Thirteen apprentices in this class have been in this class for over five years. In October 2006, the City conducted promotive testing for this group. Three apprentices did not apply for the exam, eighteen passed it, and two did not pass.

Employees In Apprentice Job Classes

Job Code	Job Title	Department ¹	Count	Average Age ²	Average LOS
7333	Apprentice Stationary Engineer	AIR	6	38	8
		DPT	1	--	7
		DPW	5	50	17
		SHF	1	--	6
		WAR	1	--	11
		7333 Total	14	43	11
7339	Apprentice Stationary Engineer, Water Treatment Plant	WTR	4	35	3
		7339 Total	4	35	3
7375	Apprentice Stationary Engineer, Sewage Plant	AIR	2	--	1
		CWP	16	39	8
		7375 Total	18	39	7
7463	Utility Plumber Apprentice	HHP	1	--	17
		WTR	22	37	7
		7463 Total	23	38	8
Total, All Classes			59	39	8
Source: HR Information System					
¹ Department codes CWP (Clean Water Program), HHP (Hetch Hetchy), and WTR (Water System), are included under PUC (Public Utilities Commission) in most DHR and City reports.					
² Average age for groups with two or fewer employees are omitted to protect privacy. Figures are included in the job class total calculations.					

Qualitative Research Summary

- As noted above, the Bureau of Labor Statistics has estimated job growth in the next seven years in the nation's manufacturing, automotive, construction, transportation and energy sectors will be faster than average for construction and building inspectors; average for mechanics, automotive service technicians, carpenters, plumbers, electricians, operating

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

engineers, painters, cement masons, sheet metal workers, roofers, and glaziers; and slower than average for welders, machinists, and laborers.

- Employers are currently experiencing shortages of skilled trades workers. In a 2005 survey of 800 U.S. manufacturers, 90% of respondents reported moderate to severe shortages of production workers such as machinists, operators, and technicians; a 2006 Federal Reserve Bank survey found finding qualified workers to be the largest, and fastest growing, concern of manufacturers.³⁸ They predict hiring will become more difficult because skilled Baby Boomers are retiring, technological advances are eliminating truly unskilled jobs, and younger workers shy away from jobs they see as unprestigious, dirty, and lacking in opportunity.³⁹ City staff interviewed for this report echoed these concerns.
- Nationally and in the City, candidates with math and technical aptitude are not choosing careers in the skilled trades, despite potentially high salaries. Many of those who are attracted lack the high school diploma and/or basic skills to gain entry to apprenticeship programs.
- Technological change is driving demand within the crafts. For example, demand for steamfitters is declining as steam heating systems are replaced by electric heating systems. However, large buildings near water treatment plants (such as those at the Airport) will continue to use steam heat due to its cost-effectiveness.
- Until there is substantial rebuilding of the City's infrastructure, there will be an ongoing need for craftspeople trained to maintain the current one. Plumbing and electrical configurations are often unique with the City's buildings; experience shows that training staff to understand the features of buildings and other infrastructure will result in the most efficient and effective repairs. This applies to machinists, cable splicers, certain technicians and other groups that serve unique parts of the City's transportation and utility infrastructure. As private sector demand for these specialties decreases, the hiring pool will shrink.
- While there are currently Utility Plumber apprentices learning to service water mains and sewers, there is no program to train indoor plumbing skills. Departments with large facilities, such as the Airport, Port, and Recreation and Park Department, anticipate a shortage in this group.
- Craft union representatives and managers agree it has become harder to attract young people to the skilled trades because of the high value placed on having a college degree. For those with the potential to go to college, the trades are often a less socially accepted career path. At the same time, individuals who are interested in the trades do not qualify because they lack high school diplomas and/or can not meet the testing requirements to enter apprenticeship programs.

³⁸ Business Outlook Survey. 2006. Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia.
<http://www.phil.frb.org/files/bos/bos1006.html> October.

³⁹ Skills Gap Report – A Survey of the American Manufacturing Workforce. 2005. National Association of Manufacturers' Manufacturing Institute/Center for Workforce Success and Deloitte Consulting LLP.
http://www.nam.org/s_nam/bin.asp?CID=89&DID=235731&DOC=FILE.PDF

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Younger workers in the skilled trades are often attracted to the private construction industry, because they are willing to risk irregular periods of employment for high pay. The City tends to attract experienced candidates who seek regular hours, health benefits, job security and work-life balance. The City likely benefits from the experience, however, this is challenging in occupations that are physically demanding and hazardous.

Apprenticeship Programs

- DHR is working with departments and unions on a citywide apprenticeship program focused on skilled trades that could eventually be expanded to other types of positions. Staff are addressing implementation issues including program governance, list referrals, appointment status, position budgeting and TXing needed to fill positions at the appropriate level.
- Interviews with departments indicate the best potential for an apprenticeship program in the near term, based on need and practical factors, are the 7338 Electrical Line Workers (used in PUC, TIS, and MTA) and various types of Stationary Engineers.
- Design of an expanded citywide apprenticeship program will be the key to its success. Lessons learned from the Utility Plumber Apprenticeship program include:
 - 1) Apprentices must either move up to the journey or out of the program within a certain time frame
 - 2) City employment should not be guaranteed to all apprentices
 - 3) Apprenticeship salaries must be set at a level that removes the incentive to stay at the apprentice level. For Utility Plumber apprentices hired before July 1, 2006, the maximum salary is 95% of that of a journey level plumber. For those hired after that date, the maximum is 82.5%.
 - 4) The number of apprentices brought on should be as close as possible to the number of expected future vacancies.
- The number of apprentices should be set at a level that the City will commit to supporting for the duration of an apprenticeship program, typically four to five years. This includes both training costs and budgeted positions. Departments faced with the choice of filling a budgeted position with an apprentice or journey level employee will choose the latter, unless the problem has become so acute that no journey level workers can be hired (the City is now reaching this point with electrical line workers).

12 Adult Probation Department

The Adult Probation Department has a workforce of 103 employees with an average age of 47.6 and average length of service of 14.4 years.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average length of service for an Adult Probation employee of 14.4 is higher than the citywide average of 12.7.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- The largest age group is 35-44 (31.1%), different from the largest age group citywide of 45-54 (36.2%). The largest length of service group is 5-9 (40.8%), which is a higher percentage than the citywide average of 29.8% for the same age group.
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 7 new hires and 31 separations.
- 43.7% are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 26.2% are eligible for service retirement compared to the citywide average of 20.9%. Employees eligible for service retirement are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for 8434 - Supervising Adult Probation Officer and 8444 - Deputy Probation Officer job classes:
 - Currently, 4 out of 10 8434- Supervising Adult Probation Officers are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 6 likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). For the 8444 - Deputy Probation Officer job class, 16 out of 72 employees are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 4 likely to retire soon.
 - In 5 years, 80% of 8434 - Supervising Adult Probation Officers will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 30% will likely retire soon. In addition, 46% of employees in the 8444 job class will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 15% will likely retire soon.

Qualitative Research Summary

- Maintaining adequate hiring staffing levels is a concern today and in the short-term. Over the last several years, the department's workforce has decreased due to cuts.
- As a field, adult probation programs have shifted from corrections to intensive case management and rehabilitation, so that candidates with social science backgrounds are increasingly sought over those with criminal justice. The case management model goes beyond report writing and processing files; it requires probation officers to conduct risk and needs assessments and then connect parolees with educational, physical health, mental health, and employment resources. There is also a shift toward evidence-based practices, which requires staff to be attuned to, and ready to incorporate, techniques that are proven to reduce recidivism.
- In most adult probation departments, officers' time is evenly divided between field work and administrative tasks. Some have an Intensive Supervision Unit (ISU) to provide intensive case management and surveillance of parolees. Due to limited resources and staffing, Adult Probation currently conducts much less field work than comparable departments.
- The department faces some competition from state and federal agencies, many of which are able to provide probation officers with higher salaries, better retirement benefits, flexibility, and work/life balance. However, employees tend to remain employed with the department, so retirement and attrition are not currently considered a substantial risk.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Case management is increasingly conducted using electronic case notes, which will require officers to conduct field work with field computers. There will be a greater need to develop staff technology skills in risk and needs assessment tools as well as inter-agency data management systems such as JUSTIS.

ADP has identified some the following workforce planning strategies:

- Communicating the importance of the department's work as part of an overall increase in recruitment activity.
- The department is revising its two manuals of standard operating procedures so that new employees can use them to learn quickly on the job.
- The quality of training for adult probation officers in California is considered to be low compared to that of other law enforcement groups. The Chief is on a statewide probation task force to increase and standardize quality through certification of trainers.
- The department also plans to begin transferring cases out of the county. It is a standard practice among probation departments to verify addresses and transfer cases to the parolee's county of residence. The department estimates that this change would reduce probation officer caseloads by up to 30%, which is the proportion of crimes committed in San Francisco by non-residents. With fewer cases, the department could focus on more comprehensive case management to improve long-term outcomes and better utilize the training of ADP staff.

13 Fire Department

The Fire Department has workforce of 1,699 employees. There are 1,602 sworn personnel with an average age of 43.4 and average length of service of 13.9 years. In addition, there are 97 miscellaneous employees with an average age of 49.9 and average length of service of 15.7 years. Data for these two groups are presented separately below.

Quantitative Research Summary - Sworn Employees

- The largest age group is 35-44, comprising at 44.4 % of the sworn workforce, followed by the 45-54 group at 30.3%. The largest length of service group is 5-9 at 27.4% of the sworn workforce.
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were a total of 302 new hires and 497 separations. Over the five-year period, 79.5% (395) of employees left the City as a result of retirement. The average age of those retiring was 56.4 years of age.
- 25% of sworn personnel are eligible for service retirement. This means that if they joined prior to 1976, they are at least 50 years old with 25 years of service. If they joined after 1976, they are at least 50 years old with 5 years of service. (Note: there are a few members with buy-outs who have not been separately analyzed.)
- 10% of sworn personnel are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 55 for sworn personnel with years of service eligibility based on start date requirements.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Lieutenant (H 20, 22, 24, 28)- 54% of employees in these job classes are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 70% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 54% will likely retire (based on an average retirement age of 56 years old and meeting years of service based on start date pre- or post- 1976).
- H2 Firefighter- 20% of employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 8% likely to retire soon (based on an average retirement age of 56 years old and meeting years of service based on start date pre- or post- 1976). In 5 years, 35% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 20% will likely retire.
- H3- Firefighter/Paramedic- 13% of employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 3% likely to retire soon (based on an average retirement age of 56 years old and meeting years of service based on start date pre- or post- 1976). In 5 years, 27% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 13% will likely retire.
- H33- EMS Captain- 25% of employees in the job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 58% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 25% will likely retire (based on an average retirement age of 56 years old and meeting years of service based on start date pre- or post- 1976).

Quantitative Research Summary - Miscellaneous Employees

- For miscellaneous employees, the average age of 49.9 years, compared to the citywide average of 47.9, and the average length of service of 15.7 years is higher than the citywide average of 12.7 years.
- The largest age group is at 41.2% of the miscellaneous workforce is 45-54 years old, slightly higher than the largest citywide age group of 45-54 (36.2% of the city's workforce). The largest length of service group is 15-19 at 23.7% of the miscellaneous workforce, which is different from the largest citywide length of service group of 5-9 (29.6% of the city workforce).
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 17 new hires and 46 separations.
- 32% of miscellaneous employees are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 3% of miscellaneous employees are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is lower than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - 6281- Fire Safety Inspector 2- 38% of employees in the job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 85 % will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 8% will likely retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 7388- Utility Plumber- 42% employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 63% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and one will likely retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).
- 1654- Principal Accountant- The employee in this job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, the employee will likely retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

The department has experienced the following workforce drivers and issues:

- Since 9/11, there is increased funding and training for first responders and hazmat-related skills. The department is sharing data with other agencies and jurisdictions and participating in intelligence groups. More stringent fire prevention codes have meant more public interactions for fire prevention staff.
- Following the practice of many other jurisdictions, San Francisco moved its emergency medical services function from the Department of Public Health to the Fire Department in the 1990s. Since that time, emergency medical service requests have grown, and now represent over 60% of all calls for service. The department has had to compete with other jurisdictions for staff with paramedic skills.⁴⁰
- Proposition F, passed by the voters in November 2005, established baseline firehouse staffing requirements. Projections of staffing needs will be driven by these requirements over analysis of changing demographics, demand for services, and other factors.
- New employee demographics have shifted in the past 30 years, affecting employment patterns and turnover. Through the 1970s, many new firefighters came with military and blue collar work experience. Beginning in the 1980s, more new firefighters came with college degrees and expectations of more career change and mobility, and a larger number have left to pursue higher education. Still, firefighter retention and recruitment are not issues.
- Unlike nearly all other departments, the Fire Department has a formal way of gauging retirement risk, because employees file Intent to Retire notices. The notices are not binding, however, and staff feel they have become less useful indicators over time, particularly as there have been fewer promotional exams in recent years.
- Changes to the paramedic classification approximately two years ago, which allow the department to hire single-function paramedics rather than cross-trained firefighter-paramedics, have eased recruitment and retention problems in emergency medical services.
- Many new firefighters were hired between 1972-1974, and these employees are now beginning to retire. This may require increased hiring activity.
- Promotional exams for sworn personnel take a long time due to the high number of appeals and litigation typically involved. This reduces the frequency with which the department is able to hold examinations.

⁴⁰ A Review of the Fire-EMS System. 2004. Controller's Office. City & County of San Francisco. February 28.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Suppression employees do not always have the soft skills needed to promote positions in fire prevention.

The department is pursuing the following succession and workforce planning strategies:

- The department is preparing a strategic plan, which includes staffing, training, a new regional training facility, and other factors which affect services. HR staff are also conducting an internal review of divisions to help identify services that are duplicated or could be handled more efficiently by other divisions. This review will help the department with their workforce plans.
- The department has revised its academy instruction and other training over the years. Simulation technology has helped to create exercises in which fire fighters can practice their skills and more senior members can share their knowledge with new employees.
- Staff would like to prepare operations staff for administrative positions by selecting a group of employees to shadow employees in these roles. In this way, there would be a pool of prepared candidates. Currently, when a senior staff member leaves, it can take three to six months to fill the vacancy, and the institutional knowledge leaves with them.

14 Human Services Agency

The Human Services Agency has a workforce of 1,820 employees with an average age of 47.1 and average length of service of 11.8.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average length of service for an HSA employee 11.8 years, slightly lower than the citywide average of 12.7 years.
- Compared to the city as a whole, HSA has a higher proportion of employees with less than five years of service and fewer with 20-24 years of service.
- 38.4% of employees are currently eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is slightly lower than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 19.0% of employees are currently eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is slightly lower than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - 2905 Senior Eligibility Worker. 27% of employees in this class are currently eligible to retire and 6% are likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 46% will be eligible to retire and 15% will likely retire.
 - 2948 Human Services Section Manager. 38% of employees in this class are currently eligible to retire. In five years, 57% will be eligible to retire and 33% likely to retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 1632 Senior Account Clerk. 36% of employees are currently eligible to retire and 14% likely to retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In five years, 59% will be eligible to retire and 32% likely to retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

The Human Services Agency has a workforce of over 2,000 employees housed in 20 locations. Current and future workforce drivers in the social services sector include:

- The service delivery model is focusing on community outreach and fieldwork, especially in medical and income-maintenance programs (CalWORKs, food stamps, MediCal, In Home Supportive Services, foster care). Workers will be going out into the field to determine eligibility, interview program participants, and conduct casework.
- Outreach and fieldwork will require a change in technology, with wireless handheld devices used to collect applications, capture participant data, and even fingerprint potential foster care families. There is currently an imaging project for existing case files; in the future, they will be updated electronically in the field, not transcribed from written notes. Automation will improve data quality and availability for state and federal audits and reporting requirements; it will also require current employees, particularly eligibility workers and clerical staff, to improve their computer skills. The need for clerical positions will decrease.
- Increasing language diversity among clientele requires more bilingual staff. The department is already having some difficulty in hiring bilingual employees, especially Spanish speakers.
- In most job classes where age and length of service statistics indicate potential retirement risk (e.g. 2905 Senior Eligibility Worker, 2913 Program Specialist, 2915 Program Specialist Supervisor, 9705 Employment and Training Specialist), the department is less concerned with turnover and retention than ability to hire efficiently and effectively, particularly with 2948 Human Services Section Managers. Recruitment in these classes is not a problem given their relatively high salaries.
- For Citywide administrative classes in budget, HR, and IT, comparably lower salaries and the lack of updated lists and/or registries are considered bottlenecks to hiring, however, participation in the Controller's Office 1649 Accounting Intern Program has provided a steady supply of skilled workers for accounting positions.
- The agency's work is subject to ongoing and significant state and federal legislative changes. Historical perspective on the operational effect of such changes, and the ability to implement them, is particularly important for program managers in class 2969 Human Services Section Manager. The department's goal is to prepare 2948 Human Services Section Manager for these positions.

HSA has identified a number of strategies to prepare for future service needs:

- The department has identified a succession planning manager and is working with DHR's recruitment manager to locate candidates with language skills. Staff note that flexible work hours would also help recruitment. The revitalization of the Bilingual Skills

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

program through a partnership for San Francisco State University - College of Extended Learning may be another way to attract and retain bilingual staff. Customized classes will be provided on-site for staff that to hone language skills in English, Spanish, Vietnamese, and Russian.

- Staff have improved and updated Personnel and Staff Development Intranet pages; updated the HR policies and procedures manual; and developed a Human Services Training Catalog for 2007.
- The department conducts in-house computer and technical training. Employees are encouraged to attend training in-house or through City University. There is also a 3-month induction program for the Employment and Training Specialists (classes 9702, 9703, and 9705), Eligibility Workers (classes 2903 and 2905), and 2904 Human Services Technicians.
- In preparation for more automation of human services records, HSA is planning Admin Pro, a program to train clerical employees in computer, customer service, and phone skills.
- This fiscal year, the department is also revitalizing the Human Services certificate program which provides employees interested in social work with a foundation for the work of a human services agency. Participants take a variety of classes at City College over a two-year period. Application is open to all employees.
- The department will revitalize its Mentoring Towards Success Program to give approximately 15 HSA employees per year the opportunity to learn about a variety of HSA programs, develop operational and management skills, and work with the executive management team in completing a predefined project. Participants will develop supportive, professional relationships with senior members of the agency management team.
- Lastly, the department plans to revitalize a management academy for line supervisors and leadership training for mid-managers department-wide. Executive staff will recommend that mid-managers participate various sessions of the UC Davis Leadership series.

15 Juvenile Probation Department

The Juvenile Probation Department has three groups of employees: probation officers, counselors, and administrative staff. The Juvenile Probation Department has a workforce of 243 employees with an average age of 49.3 and average length of service of 16.2.

Quantitative Research Summary

- Both the average age and length of service for JUV employees are higher than the citywide averages; 49.3 versus 47.9 and 16.2 versus 12.7.
- The department has a much higher proportion of its workforce in the 55-64 age group—30% compared to 13% citywide.
- The department has a higher proportion of employees in the 20-24 years, 25-29 years, and 30+ years of service groups than the City as a whole.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 8 new hires and 73 separations.
- 44.4% of employees are currently eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years of age and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 27.2% of employees are currently eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 6.2% of employees are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is higher than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - 8444 Deputy Probation Officer. 32% of employees in this class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 10% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 62% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 22% will be likely to retire soon.
 - 8320 Counselor, Juvenile Hall. 16% of employees in this class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 42% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 9% are likely to retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).
 - Senior and supervising counselors: 8322 Senior Counselor, Juvenile Hall, 8323 Senior Counselor Boys Ranch, 8324 Supervising Counselor, Juvenile Court. 54% of employees in these classes are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In five years, 77% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 46% will be likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

- Maintaining adequate staffing levels is the department's main concern today and in the short-term. In the past several years, overtime and workers' compensation costs have increased, and supervisory and management capacity have decreased. The number of youth served has not decreased.
- In 2000 counselors became eligible for workers' compensation benefits under the provisions of State Labor Code 4850, which provides a year of full pay, untaxed, per job-related injury. The department has been using overtime to meet state-mandated staffing levels when employees are out on disability. As noted above, average age and years of service of employees has increased. Average age is generally correlated with increased injury rates, especially for physically demanding positions such as counselor.
- Both administrative and operational staff positions have been cut. Second level probation officer supervisors, who are not eligible for federal salary reimbursement, were reduced, and remaining direct supervisors were assigned more reports. Many supervisors are currently line staff in acting assignments. Institutional knowledge about processes was lost when administrative staff were cut and is now being rebuilt.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Recent trends in juvenile justice philosophy and clientele are expected to continue, and will effect the types of employees the department seeks. First, the focus of juvenile probation programs has shifted from corrections to social work and rehabilitation. Also, the client population has changed; there are more youth of color, they are more likely to be involved in felonies and violent crimes, and many have mental health problems. Nearly all are involved in other public social service systems such as foster care and child welfare programs. Counselors and probation officers with the skills and background to deal with these changes are needed.

Key workforce planning objectives in the short term include:

- Hiring permanent supervisory level employees. The department has been working with DHR in the past year to move employees from acting supervisory assignments to permanent supervisory positions.
- Reinstating physical agility testing for counselor positions to ensure new hires can perform essential job functions. This testing was put on hold for several years, and will now be reintroduced.
- Expanding beyond the traditional recruitment pool of college graduates with criminal justice majors to include more applicants with social work, social justice, political science, and public service degrees and experience. Increase counselors and probation officers with language and cultural backgrounds that reflect the client population. A recent exam for probation officers yielded a strong applicant pool with diverse training and experience.
- Providing supervisory skills training for newly-hired supervisors and managers.
- Reducing time to hire by finding a more efficient way to complete background checks, perhaps by collaborating with other departments to achieve economies of scale.
- Providing temporary exempt, as-needed positions to college students, and allow time served in these appointments to automatically qualify them for permanent positions upon graduation. Many temporary exempt employees accept positions with other jurisdictions that are able to offer full time in a more timely manner.

16 Library

The Public Library has a workforce of 701 employees with an average age of 45.5 and average length of service of 13.6 years.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average age of Library employees is 45.5 years, slightly below the citywide average of 47.9. The average length of service is 13.6 years, slightly higher than the citywide average of 12.7 years.
- Compared to the city as a whole, there are a higher proportion of Library employees in the 23-35 age group and a lower proportion in the 45-54 group.
- Compared to the city as a whole, the Library has a lower proportion of employees with less than five years of service and a larger proportion with 10-14 years of service.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 78 new hires and 169 separations at the Library.
- Compared to the City as a whole, the Library has a lower proportion of employees that are currently eligible for vesting retirement, 36.5% versus 40.9%. Employees eligible for vesting retirement are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service.
- 3.4% of Library employees are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is lower than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - Librarian series, classes 3630, 3632, 3634. 30% of employees in these classes are currently eligible to retire, and 6% are likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 49% will be eligible to retire and 17% will likely retire.
 - Library assistant series, classes 3610, 3616, and 3618. 23% of employees in these classes are currently eligible to retire, and 5% are likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 34% will be eligible to retire and 13% will likely retire.
 - MCCP classes. 33% of employees in these classes are currently eligible to retire. In five years, 66% will be eligible to retire and 33% will be likely to retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

- Increased social diversity—in terms of race, ethnicity, language, age, educational background, economic status, and other dimensions—is having a profound impact on the ability of libraries nationwide to remain relevant to the communities they serve. San Francisco is in direct competition with library systems nationwide to recruit minority and bilingual librarians, who are only graduating from MLIS programs at rates that will keep up with current attrition.⁴¹
- Libraries have shifted their approach to services due to changes in the way people access information. Rather than focusing on collection development and making themselves available to serve patrons, libraries are actively marketing themselves to the community, reaching customers where they are. Staff must be externally focused, adept at marketing, and willing to see themselves as service facilitators rather than just direct service providers.
- Age and length of service data indicate a risk of retirement among librarians. This may provide an opportunity to hire and retain staff with newest skills to meet changing needs. MOU provisions mean reassignments are filled by existing staff, limiting the number of new hires. The low number of retirements and vacancies has made it difficult to promote employees in the library assistant series (3610, 3616, and 3618). This situation can create two different results: good potential candidates for promotion may leave the organization

⁴¹ Diversity Counts. 2007. American Library Association, Office for Research and Statistics and Office for Diversity. January.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

in order to find other opportunities, while others stay but become frustrated and less effective by the inability to promote.

- Changes in information technology have had an enormous impact on the field; in general, library graduate programs and internal training are addressing the need to learn new technology.
- Professional programs do not teach management skills, such as HR, budget, performance evaluation, efficient program management, and conflict management. The Library needs to build these skills among librarians (classes 3630-3636) who become supervisors, and make sure it hires employees with the capacity to learn them. Programs also do not teach critical leadership skills, such as how to deal with elected officials, Library Commissioners, and the community.
- Local recruitment has become somewhat more difficult now that UC Berkeley no longer has an accredited MLIS program (there are only two in California).
- The department's \$106 million Branch Library Improvement Program will mean ongoing restructuring of staffing, presenting both challenges and opportunities. The complexities of moving staff from location to location, providing onsite training, and shifting teams, while continuing to provide excellent customer service, present challenges for both staff and their supervisors. At the same time, it will present opportunities for cross-training and team-building that could benefit both individual staff and the staff as a whole.

The Library has developed a number workforce planning strategies:

- The department Training Manual, developed by the department's Training and Development Committee, provides information on learning opportunities to all employees. Training offerings were developed through a survey of staff needs on content, timing, and utility of prior training experiences. Supervisors and managers are encouraged to give employees time to attend. All new staff attend an orientation with information on policies and procedures. Worksite-specific orientations will begin in shortly.
- Skills of security staff that bumped into the department have been assessed by a police captain, and as a result employees will receive training at the Police Academy.
- The department has developed recruitment materials with detailed housing and transportation information. Cost of living remains a problem.
- The department is actively involved in industry associations, which provide professional development opportunities. Two groups of employees have participated in the Urban Libraries Council Executive Leadership Institute, and is a Partner Library in the Council's Librarians for Americas Neighborhoods, which provides scholarships to a diverse group of MLIS students. City Librarian Luis Herrera chairs the leadership development efforts of the Public Library Association.
- The department is seeking to develop a Leadership Training Academy to provide supervisory skills training for new supervisors (typically Librarians I and II), and leadership training (generally for Librarians III and IV).

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- The department would like to target staff with leadership skills for knowledge management or mentoring, either before they leave or part time after retirement. This would be easier if requisitions overlapped, as there is no guarantee that an employee will return after retirement.

17 Municipal Transportation Agency

The Municipal Transportation Agency has a workforce of 4,729 employees with an average age of 49.6 and average length of service of 13.6 years.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average age of employees in the department mirrors the citywide average, while the average length of service is slightly higher than the citywide average.
- Compared to the city as a whole, there are a higher proportion of MTA employees in the 5-9 length of service group.
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 772 new hires and 1,463 separations.
- There are a higher proportion of MTA employees eligible for vesting retirement, those with at least 50 years of age and at least 5 years of service (46.2%) compared to the citywide average (40.9%).
- There are a higher proportion of MTA employees eligible for service retirement, those that are at least 50 years of age with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service (24.2%) compared to the citywide average (20.9%).
- While there was some retirement risk in a number of supervisory job classes, vacancies in many of these classes are typically filled through internal promotions without problem. However, the department is concerned about vacancies in the following classes:
 - 7228- Automotive Transit Shop Supervisor- half of the three employees in this class are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In five years, five of the six employees will be eligible to retire, though none are considered likely to retire within the next ten years (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).
 - 7235- Transit Power Line Supervisor- 38% of employees are eligible to retire today. In five years, 88% will be eligible to retire, and 13% will be likely to retire.
 - 7318- Electric Maintenance Technician- 49% of employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 11% likely to retire soon. In 5 years, 72% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 33% will likely retire.
 - 7332 Maintenance Machinist- nearly a third of employees are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits, and 10% are likely to retire soon. In five years, 72% will be eligible to retire, and 17% will be likely to retire.
 - 7371- Electrical Transit System Mechanic- 33% of the employees in the job class, are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 9% likely to retire soon. In 5

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

years, 50% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 21% will likely retire.

- 7390- Welder- In 5 years, 75% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 33% will likely retire.

Qualitative Research Summary

The primary workforce planning drivers and issues in this department in the next few years are:

- Vehicle components for all modes are shifting from mechanical to electronic, and hybrid bus technology has been introduced. This is changing skills needed in numerous classes, particularly the 7371 Electric Maintenance Technician. Parking meter components are also increasingly electronic, although this represents more of a classification and exam issue than a recruitment problem for the MTA.
- Not all parts of the system will modernize. The City will have to train its own 7473 Wire Rope Cable Maintenance Mechanics to repair and maintain the cables that power its historic cable cars. The candidate pool is limited, as few industries require cable repair and maintenance skills aside from ski lift operators and some bridge repairers. The work is grimy and physically strenuous.
- A society that values college degrees and professional careers over manual work will continue to make recruiting skilled tradespeople challenging. The most difficult jobs to fill are those which are physically arduous with hazardous working conditions, particularly the 7366 Transit Power Line Worker. Employees work with live high voltage lines overhead and in confined spaces underground, in traffic, contributing to high injury rates nationwide. Competition for trained workers increased after Sacramento and Santa Clara introduced light rail systems. As with the 7338s, the main competition is utility companies and other transit agencies. The department tried to modify minimum qualifications for the position to allow anyone with high voltage experience qualify, but it turned out that overhead line experience was crucial to performance. The MTA negotiated wage increases for the class to match Santa Clara, but this has not yet increased the number of applications.
- While it is difficult to recruit young tradespeople, they tend to stay with the department once hired. These positions offer security, good benefits, work-life balance, and union representation. However, the department finds it difficult both to recruit and retain young professionals, including engineers and administrative staff who prefer private sector benefits such as higher salaries, travel opportunities, job flexibility, promotional opportunities and numerous and easily-accessible training and development opportunities. Once hired, many professionals leave after seven to ten years when they have reached middle management levels and are uncertain about further promotional opportunities.

MTA has identified some the following workforce planning strategies:

- MTA is designing its Management Core Curriculum to give entry-level employees (parking control officers, electricians, mechanics, transit operators) the tools to promote to supervisory positions. Candidates will need to complete training in order to be eligible for promotion, and completion of training will be recorded in employees' performance

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

evaluations. The intent is to use existing training resources such as City University and other DHR classes. A program coordinator position has been budgeted.

- On days when applications for entry-level positions are being accepted, staff are available to help applicants complete the paperwork, thus making the hiring process more accessible to first time applicants.
- There are two programs that utilize full time 9916 Public Service Aides. The first is a six-month program through which participants can qualify to become 7410 Automotive Service Workers or 9102 Transit Car Cleaners. The second is the Muni Transit Assistant Program (MTAP) for local residents, which offers three years of training in areas such as transit security, customer service, and transit inspection. There are currently 14 MTAP participants. Over the course of the program participants reach milestones that make them eligible to test for permanent positions. This program has yielded some permanent hires, particularly transit fare inspectors.
- The Transit Academy is a new program that will be designed in cooperation with labor unions and the school district to encourage high school students to stay in school, and to consider careers in transit when they graduate. It is not intended to duplicate apprenticeship programs, rather, it should provide candidates for them.
- The MTA would like to increase participation in existing apprenticeship programs, but notes that the City has historically not funded participation in such programs, and that program design will be key to success. For example, apprentices can not be guaranteed jobs, and the system must be “up and out.”

18 Police Department

The Police Department has a workforce of 2,509 employees divided into two distinct employee groups: sworn and non-sworn (or miscellaneous). These two groups are analyzed separately because they have different demographics, employment patterns, and retirement trends which require different workforce and succession planning strategies. There are 2,172 sworn personnel with an average age of 43.3 and average length of service of 16.3. In addition, there are 337 miscellaneous employees with an average age of 49.1 and average length of service of 15.5.

Quantitative Research Summary - Sworn Personnel

- 37.2% of sworn personnel are in 45-54 age group, followed by 34.6% in the 35-44 age group.
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 436 new hires and 570 separations. Of those leaving City employment, 59.8% (341) of employees were retiring; the average age of the employee was 55.4.
- 27% of sworn personnel are eligible for service retirement. This means that if they joined prior to 1976, they are at least 50 years old with 25 years of service. If they joined after 1976, they are at least 50 years old with 5 years of service. (Note: There are a few members with buy-outs that have not been separately analyzed.)

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 8% of sworn employees are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 55 for sworn personnel with years of service eligibility based on start date requirements pre- or post-1976 start date.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - 0380- Inspector- In 5 years, 100% of these employees will likely retire (based on average retirement at 50 years old meeting years of service based on start date pre/post 1976).
 - Sergeants (Q 50, 51, 52)- 40% of total employees in these job classes are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 12% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 50 years old meeting years of service based on start date pre- or post- 1976). In 5 years, 68% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 40% will likely retire.
 - Lieutenants (Q 60, 61 62)- 45% of total employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 13% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 50 years old meeting years of service based on start date pre- or post- 1976). In 5 years, 78% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 45% will likely retire.
 - Captain 3 (Q82)- 73% of total employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 23% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 50 years old meeting years of service based on start date pre- or post- 1976). In 5 years, 97% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 73% will likely to retire.

Quantitative Research Summary - Miscellaneous Employees

- For miscellaneous employees, both the average age and length of service is higher than the citywide average, 49.1 years old versus 47.9 years old and 15.5 years versus 12.7.
- Compared to the city as a whole, there are a higher proportion of POL miscellaneous employees in the 30+ length of service group; 31.2% versus 4.4%.
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 46 new hires and 84 separations.
- Compared to the city as a whole, there are a higher proportion of miscellaneous employees eligible for service retirement, those that are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service; 28% versus 20.9%.
- 7% of miscellaneous employees are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is higher than the citywide average of 4.4%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - Fingerprint Technicians (8250 and 8251)- 80% of employees in these job classes are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 27% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 93% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 67% will likely retire.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 1222- Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk- 100% of employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 50% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 75% will likely retire.
- 8202- Security Guard- In 5 years, 88% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 38% will likely retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).
- 8213- Police Services Aide- In 5 years, 89% of employees in this job class will likely retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

The City Charter mandates the number of field officers at 1,971. Given that many officers are nearing retirement, the City has moved to improve recruitment, testing, training, and retention in the past two years:

- Continuous testing is being conducted for entry-level positions, with a goal of five classes of 50 recruits each to bring on up to 250 new officers annually.
- A promotional examination for Q50 Sergeant was completed in 2006, and the goal is to have one promotional exam each year so that testing is conducted for the sergeant, lieutenant, and captain ranks once every three years.
- Background investigations can be a major bottleneck in hiring. The department has almost doubled investigations capacity by recruiting retired investigators to its background investigations unit, and has reduced the time for this step from 12-16 weeks to approximately eight weeks.
- Success rates on the entrance exam are low—approximately 5 of every 100 applicants are selected. To increase applicant numbers and yield, the department, DHR, and City College are sponsoring a non-credit Pre-Academy Workshop to give applicants to entry level Police Officer positions insight into a career with San Francisco, information about the hiring and background qualification processes, assessment. Over 160 individuals attended workshops in January and March of this year. The program is being revised based on department and participant feedback; the department would like to offer it on a regular basis.
- The labor agreement with the Police Officers Association was recently amended to provide an additional 4% of salary to officers either over the age of 55 or with more than 30 years of service who meet work hour eligibility requirements. The goal of the amendment is to encourage officers to postpone retirement. Since most officers retire at the point that they become eligible for the maximum level of retirement benefits, it is possible that additional economic incentives could work.
- Knowledge management is generally less of an issue in the Police function than in other areas as procedures are documented in General Orders, and the state requires supervisory, management, and leadership training for certain ranks. However, an experienced officer night premium has helped incent more senior officers to work night shifts with new recruits, when there are typically fewer seasoned officers working, thereby providing leadership and experience for newer officers.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

In addition, the Police Department's other immediate workforce and succession planning objectives include:

- Adapting to changes in technology. Many officers currently do not have easy access to computers for email or report writing. The department is currently developing a staffing plan to automate report writing and expand crime mapping, an increasingly important tool in crime analysis and response.
- Civilianization of administrative positions as required by the Charter. A consulting firm is currently completing an assessment of administrative functions to implement civilianization.
- Increasing hires of officers from other jurisdictions by creating a shorter training academy. Currently lateral hires must complete the entire Police Academy training program, regardless of their years of experience.
- Recruitment incentives include a \$1,000 referral bonus for current officers who refer individuals who complete academy and field training, and a \$5,000 bonus to officers in other police departments who transfer to the SFPD, payable upon completion of field training.
- Promoting the Police Cadet Program. Cadets must be high school graduates who are enrolled in college and maintaining a minimum 2.0 GPA. Cadets work 20 hours per week while attending school on a variety of data entry and public assistance tasks. They are mentored by officers, encouraged to avoid activities that disqualify many police officer applicants, such as drug use and traffic violations, and encouraged to join the department when they graduate. The Cadet program has yielded many high quality officers in the past.

19 Public Health Department

The Department of Public Health has a workforce of 5,908 employees with an average age of 47.7 and average length of service of 12.5 years. The department also has many staff available as needed to address fluctuations in patient census.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average age is 47.7 years, equivalent to the citywide average of 47.9. The average length of service is 12.5 years, equivalent to the citywide average of 12.7 years.
- The distribution of employees among age groups in DPH is similar to the distribution of employees citywide.
- Overall, the distribution of employees by length of service groups is similar to the distribution citywide.
- 41.2% of DPH employees are currently eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 20.6% of DPH employees are currently eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is similar to the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 4.0% of DPH employees are currently likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This is just under the citywide average of 4.4%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - Senior nursing classes: 2322 Nurse Manager, 2323 Clinical Nurse Specialist, 2324 Nursing Supervisor. 41% of employees in these classes are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In five years, 73% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits, and 27% will be likely to retire (based on the average retirement age of 60 years and having 20 years of service).
 - 2830 Public Health Nurse. 31% of employees in this class are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In five years, 58% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 11% will be likely to retire (based on the average retirement age of 60 years and having 20 years of service).
 - 6122 Senior and 6124 Principal Environmental Health Inspectors. 58% of employees in these classes are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In five years, 84% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 32% will be likely to retire (based on the average retirement age of 60 years and having 20 years of service).

Qualitative Research Summary

The department has two operational areas: Community Health Network (including San Francisco General Hospital and Laguna Honda Hospital) and Population Health and Prevention. Community Health Programs (located in various clinics throughout the City) spans both operational areas. The primary workforce planning drivers in this department in the next few years are:

- Staffing and service needs vary among the business groups, however, DPH expects current recruitment and retention difficulties to continue for the next three to five years in the critical job classes of nurse, radiology technician, pharmacy technician and pharmacist.
- State-mandated staffing levels. The State of California sets minimum nurse-to-patient staffing ratios. This has led to increased need for Registered Nurses.
- Nationwide increase in demand for health professionals, driven largely by an aging population. The U.S. Department of Labor categorizes Health Care as one of 15 National High Growth Industries, and projects much faster than average growth in the need for Home Health Aides and Physical Therapists in the next seven years, and faster than average growth for Registered Nurses, Pharmacists, Pharmacy Technicians, and Radiologic Technologists.⁴²

⁴² Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2006-07 Edition. U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Direct competition with private sector health care providers in the Bay Area, who may offer not only higher salaries, easier commutes, and more desirable work environments related to weekday-only schedules, client populations and newer equipment. Recruitment and retention issues persist for Registered Nurses in certain specialty areas, Pharmacists and Radiology Technicians despite recent salary increases, suggesting other factors besides wages may need to be addressed.
- For DPH, capturing operational knowledge of employees is less of an issue, because industry guidelines guide service delivery. Instead, the department is more concerned with retaining staff for longer periods of time and ensuring their skill levels.

There are also several drivers whose effect is not yet known:

- Technological changes. The drive to store medical records electronically may affect IT staffing.
- Laguna Honda Hospital rebuild. The size and layout of the new facility will drive staffing needs for this hospital.
- Health Access Program (HAP). In August 2006 the Board of Supervisors passed the San Francisco Health Care Security Ordinance, establishing the HAP to provide health services to uninsured residents, focusing on primary care. It is not yet known how the HAP will affect long-term staffing needs.
- Short-term care facilities to provide mental health services. DPH seeks to serve more patients in residential settings and fewer in acute care.

DPH has considered or implemented the follow programs to prepare for the future:

- A confidential survey was conducted at Laguna Honda Hospital to gauge how much longer employees thought they would remain in their current jobs. Twenty percent of respondents were considering retiring or leaving City employment within five years.
- In September 2004, the San Francisco General Hospital Foundation secured a three-year, \$2.34 million grant from the Gordon and Betty Moore Foundation to improve specialized clinical skills of associate-degree (ADNs) and foreign-trained nurses (RNs). The program has been very successful in increasing skill levels. DPH would like to fund and expand nurse training programs to improve retention, reduce vacancy rates, and improve clinical and critical thinking skills among newly-hired nurses.
- The department has a number of ongoing training programs:
 - Both hospitals have Departments of Education and Training (DETs), which provide new employee orientations, classes needed to maintain certification and licensure, and training in Microsoft applications.
 - The Occupational Health and Safety Division provides training to employees on numerous technical and administrative aspects of workplace safety.
 - Community Behavioral Health Services offers employee training in disaster mental health and workplace violence prevention.
 - The Community Health Education Section's Training Center provides training and forums on public health issues and community-based primary prevention, as

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

well as continuing education for certified health education specialists, nurses, and those with MFT, LCSW, and LPT certification.

- DPH offers trainings to employees on emergency preparedness, contract and budget processes, payroll and timekeeping, disciplinary processes, cultural competency, and other topics.
- Targeted compensation, such as premiums and retention bonuses, to support recruitment and retention for positions with high vacancy rates. For example, nurses may receive up to \$5,000 from the new hire retention bonus if they remain in their positions for at least 24 months.

20 Public Utilities Commission

The Public Utilities Commission has a workforce of 1,924 employees with an average age of 48.5 and average length of service of 13.1 years.

Quantitative Research Summary

- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 456 new hires and 499 separations.
- 41.0% of employees are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is similar to the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 22.3% of employees are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is similar to the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 4.8% of employees are likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This percentage is similar to the citywide average of 4.4%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes⁴³:
 - 2481 and 2482 Water Quality Technician- 26% of employees are currently eligible to retire. In five years, 47% will be eligible to retire, and 18% will be likely to retire (based on average retirement age of 60 years).
 - 5211 and 5212 Engineer- 34% are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years 62% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 21% will likely retire.
 - 6318- Construction Inspector- In 5 years 57% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 21% will likely retire.
 - 7229- Transmission Line Supervisor- In 5 years, 100% of employees in this class will likely retire.

⁴³ The PUC's Workforce Planning and Development staff have provided alternative retirement estimates in the following classes: 6318 Construction Inspector – currently 28% of employees are eligible to retire; 7229 Transmission Line Supervisor – 100% of employees are eligible to retire and will likely retire soon; 7250 Utility Plumber Supervisor 1 – 40% are currently eligible to retire.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 7250- Utility Plumber Supervisor 1- In 5 years 63% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 11% will likely retire.
- 7316 and 7317 Water Service Inspector- 44 % of employees in these classes are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 18% likely to retire soon. In 5 years, 79% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 32% will likely retire.
- 7372 and 7373 Stationary Engineer, Sewage Plant- 29% of employees in these classes are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years 61% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 12% will likely retire.

Qualitative Research Summary

The PUC provides water, wastewater collection, treatment and disposal, and municipal power services in San Francisco. It also supplies water to customers in other Bay Area counties.

Key workforce planning drivers in the area of public utilities include:

- The \$4.3 billion Water System Improvement Program launched in 2002 to repair, replace, and seismically upgrade the 100-year-old Hetch Hetchy water system is a force behind current and future hiring needs. Hiring needs to be reliable for capital projects to be delivered on time.
- The department's workforce and succession planning efforts will be assisted by each division's 10-year capital plans.
- There will be a greater emphasis on conservation and environmentally friendly techniques, but the extent is not yet known. If the department adopted solar and wind power generation techniques, this would call for staff with new areas of training and experience.
- At the same time it is building the new water system, the PUC must still operate older facilities, which require employees familiar with these facilities and their technology. The PUC uses Prop F (i.e. employees who work part-time after retirement) to help meet these needs.
- On the whole, the PUC competes less with other departments and more with other large public and private sector employers in the utility, construction, and manufacturing industries for employees.

The PUC highlighted the following employee groups as areas of current and future hiring concern:

- One area of particular concern is classes 7338 Electrical Line Worker and classes 7480-84 Power Generation Technician, which work with the high voltage power transmission lines. The City competes with PG&E and other power companies to hire from a shrinking pool of candidates trained to perform high voltage work and willing to accept physically demanding and hazardous working conditions. Of 36 employees in these classes citywide, 27 are employed by the PUC to maintain power transmission lines from Hetch Hetchy dam in Yosemite. Staff live in a rural setting, near the power poles that they ascend daily to complete repairs. Nine employees at the Department of Telecommunications and Information Services work with high voltage in confined

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

underground spaces. The PUC is in the process of establishing an apprenticeship program for these job classes.

- Water quality lab staff from classes 2481-2489, including technicians, biologists, and chemists. While retention in these classes is excellent, recruitment and knowledge management is important because employees develop valuable technical skills and institutional knowledge.
- Industrial painters are in demand given the City's unusual combination sewer system, in which organic household wastes combine with the rocks and branches in rainwater and make painting the steel and concrete tanks more challenging. The City's pay and hours are competitive with other local employers (NUMMI car manufacturing plant, shipyards, and the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway, and Transportation District), but it is not recruiting enough.
- Machinists are needed in the City Distribution Division machine shop that makes parts for water gates and valves. The talent pool is shrinking as the private sector needs and creates fewer machinists.
- Similarly, industrial electricians are less in demand nationwide, but are needed at the PUC to keep machines operating. The department competes with other employers that move liquids, including oil refineries (of which there are several in the Bay Area) and other water systems. Staff suggest this is partly due to comparatively low salaries.
- 7336 Electronic Instrumentation Technician, Water Pollution Control. This position is hard to recruit for even though it pays well. Employees in this class calibrate and maintain the electronics that run the machinery. City College is designing a curriculum and estimating costs for a program to train interested PUC employees and local residents, who would earn an Associate's degree in electronic engineering through the program, a minimum qualification for class 7336. The PUC is looking into establishing an apprenticeship program for this class.
- 7372 and 7373 Sewage Plant Stationary Engineers are a concern as salary levels for these classes are somewhat low. While recruitment has not been a problem, the department needs to maintain hiring speed.
- Classes 5502-5508 Project Manager positions require high levels of skill to manage complex engineering projects from design and construction to project close out. The department needs to do more recruitment to expand its pool of qualified candidates for these positions.
- The department has experienced problems with the overall skill level of new IT, finance, and accounting staff. Similarly, recruitment of new engineers has not been a problem, however, the department would like to achieve greater diversity and train for public presentation skills among this group.
- The work of the 5602- Utility Specialist and 5148- Water Operations Analyst are becoming more regulatory like the 5620- Regulatory Specialist role. They are increasingly focused on environmental issues.

Other Issue Areas

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- Some supervisory or management employees earn less than their subordinates because they are not eligible for overtime, or because technical positions pay about the same as, or sometimes more than, management positions, but entail less responsibility.
- Transitions, especially those requiring knowledge management or on the job training, are challenging because of the inability to have overlapping requisitions.
- The PUC hires mid-career workers; according to the department, the average age of new hires is 49 years. These employees would have to stay past the current average retirement age (of 60.4 years) to qualify for more than minimal retirement benefits, but it is not yet well known whether this will become a pattern. A later age at the start of City service means the department must look beyond simple age and years of service data to predict retirements and therefore plan for future needs.

Current strategies:

- The PUC has created a Workforce Planning and Development team in its HR division, with at least one member dedicated to the project full time. The team's near term goal is to identify the most vulnerable job classes, and develop a plan and timeline to retain, hire, and train for these classes.
- In September 2006, the team published "Our Workforce Matters: A Guide to Succession Planning and Workforce Planning" to introduce key planning concepts and tools to managers.
- Staff are also participating in pilot knowledge management programs run by water and public power industry trade groups.
- The department currently employs stationary engineer apprentices for both water treatment and sewage, as well as utility plumber apprentices. The department's pre-apprentice program helps prepare local residents for successful application to these apprentice programs.
- The department makes health and safety training widely available to its staff, and certain groups of staff are receiving targeted training. For example, engineers are being trained in communications and presentation skills. The department would like to make its Situational Leadership Program more robust. The Program is designed for supervisors to understand their role as leaders, to recognize their own leadership style, and to promote flexible management, partnering, contracting and communication skills.
- The PUC has expanded internship programs in a variety of disciplines, including planning, engineering, HR, and finance, to provide a pipeline for entry into professional positions and increase the PUC's visibility among professional organizations.

Proposed strategies

- The PUC supports the development of apprenticeship programs in the skilled trades, but notes that success will require support from the Controller, Mayor, and Board of Supervisor's Budget Analyst to provide some additional positions, flexibility to make

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

appointments from first year apprentice through journey level using TXing, and stable funding for the duration of an apprenticeship program (four to five years).

- In addition, the department recognizes the need to prepare candidates for participation in apprenticeship programs. This means increasing math skills and working with local schools to encourage young people to apply.
- The PUC is exploring the feasibility of expanding pre-apprenticeship programs to other functional areas.
- At the same time, the PUC will seek to market itself as an employer of choice distinct from City government, as prospective employees are interested large scale capital, regional, and environmental projects, but may not be attracted to local government employment.
- The PUC proposes administrative changes to City policies to facilitate succession planning, including amending the Annual Salary Ordinance to authorize the Human Resources Director to approve permanent appointments to backfill anticipated vacancies for up to six months to allow for the transfer of mission-critical knowledge.
- The PUC has developed a Risk Assessment Application to evaluate the possibility of knowledge loss due to retirement and other types of separations. The application will be used to identify at-risk job classes and positions, capture core competencies, and create more training, more outsourcing, and broader recruitment options.

21 Recreation & Park Department

The Recreation & Park Department has a workforce of 848 employees with an average age of 48.5 and average length of service of 15.9 years.

Quantitative Research Summary

- The average length of service is 15.9 years, higher than the citywide average of 12.7 years.
- There are proportionately more employees with 30 or more years of service compared to the citywide average.
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 183 new hires and 423 separations.
- 46.1% are eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 28.3% are eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 20.9%.
- In particular, there appeared to be high retirement risk for the following job classes:
 - 3284- Recreation Director- 30% of employees in the job class is eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 45% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years 53% will be eligible to for minimum retirement benefits and 14% will likely to retire.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

- 3417- Gardener- 31% of employees in the job class are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 44% likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years, 50% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 17% will likely retire.
- 2708- Custodian- 30% of employees in the job class, 30% are eligible for minimum retirement benefits. In 5 years, 67% will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 11% will likely retire (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service).
- 3287- Assistant Recreation Supervisor- Out of 10 total employees in the job class, 5 are eligible for minimum retirement benefits with 1 likely to retire soon (based on average retirement at 60 years old with 20 years of service). In 5 years 6 will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 3 will likely to retire.

Qualitative Research Summary

The Recreation and Park Department has a workforce of over 800 employees located throughout 220 sites. Current and future workforce drivers include:

- The recreation and park field has changed significantly since it came into being. There is a greater emphasis on health and more diversity in age, physical ability, and culture of participants. Agencies must address crime, deteriorating infrastructure, increasing public demands for accountability and participation, competition for public resources, market forces, privatization, and environmentalism/land stewardship. This has led to “professionalization” in the field, and the development of employees with broad knowledge and skills, including communication and planning.
- Instead of providing direct services, staff need to facilitate the provision of services through community networks, resource sharing, and service consolidation. This requires a change in skill set and thinking which particularly affects the 3284 Recreation Director, 3287 Assistant Recreation Supervisor, and 3422 Park Section Supervisor classes.
- Connectivity issues are hampering implementation of new technology for physical maintenance and program management. Employees need computers, email, and high speed Internet connections.
- Age and length of service data indicate a risk of retirement among recreation directors. This may provide an opportunity to hire and retain staff to meet changing needs. In such cases where retirement and retention are not a problem, the department seeks faster hiring processes that yield higher quality candidates, and cites Civil Service Rules, HR processes, and lack of HR resources as barriers.
- Other structural issues cited include: 1) The decrease in exam staff at DHR led to the elimination in performance-based exams for class 3417 Gardener. This led to a decrease in the quality of skills among new hires that the department has sought to address through provisional exams. 2) Recruitment of managers is challenging because of the high cost of living. 3) Narrow job definitions restrict the department’s flexibility to get work done across bargaining unit lines.

Appendix D. Selected Detailed Analyses

REC has considered or implemented the follow programs to prepare for the future:

- The department is in the process of reengineering how it will plan and deliver recreation services to align with current industry practices.
- The department seeks to create and hire management and supervisory employees who are knowledgeable about all recreation and park services, not just specific fields such as gardening or youth sports. As part of this, the department has increased recruitment activity through professional organizations such as the National Recreation and Park Association and California Park and Recreation Society.
- The department recently conducted a very successful hiring of 0922 Neighborhood Services Managers. All hires were highly-motivated internal candidates. They participated in a two-week training on both recreation and park basics to give them a broader perspective, and are performing well.
- Knowledge management is a concern in a few cases, particularly in park maintenance. The department would like to create infrastructure documentation (including drawings) rather than replicate individuals' knowledge of facilities.
- The department would be open to filling some of its skilled crafts vacancies with apprentices if the alternative was allowing the position to remain vacant (i.e. if funding was available to fill the positions).

22 Additional WSP Efforts

There are other City departments not among the 16 groups analyzed for this report, which have implemented programs to address WSP issues. Two programs that we are aware of include:

- Board of Supervisors: The Clerk of the Board of Supervisors has had a Succession/Knowledge Management program in place since 2000. One successful component of the program is a Procedures Manual for each of the department's divisions. The Clerk of the Board initiated a job shadowing project, in which an intern spent a number of months observing and documenting various employees' work. The project included both the Clerk of the Board as well as other employees in the Clerk's office. A report was produced, addressing the work being done, how it was done, how the work fit into the entire department and what competencies were being utilized. This job shadowing project laid a foundation for the development of a Procedures Manual for each of the Department's divisions, which are updated on an annual basis.
- The Assessor-Recorder's Office has an entry-level 4260-Real Property Appraiser Trainee position that transitions into a 4261-Real Property Appraiser position. A trainee may enter the job with little or no expertise in the area of property appraisals, but through the year long program, will receive substantial classroom and on-the-job training under the supervision of professional appraisal staff. Initially a trainee may function as an assistant to a higher-level appraisal staff, and with the training and experience, will be required to perform simple and routine appraisals.

Appendix E. Sample Memo

City and County of San Francisco

Gavin Newsom
Mayor



Department of Human Resources

Philip A. Ginsburg
Human Resources Director

Date: November 29, 2006
To: Department Head
From: Donna Kotake, Workforce Development Director
Subject: **Succession and Workforce Planning**

Introduction

We are currently preparing DHR's first succession planning report. The purpose of succession and workforce planning is to make sure the City will have the right staff with the right skills to provide services in the coming years. Succession planning is a growing concern as more and more employees become eligible for retirement. Our findings will shape decisions on training, hiring, classification, and many other aspects of human resources management.

We have selected your department to participate in succession and workforce planning research and data collection. We chose departments which (i) had large numbers/percentages of potential retirements; and (ii) large departments with critical job functions. We have conducted preliminary data analyses to identify trends in employee retirement eligibility, hiring, and separations. We would like to review these data with you, and ask for your input on the needs of your department that may not be evident from data alone.

Data Overview

Attached are tables showing current and projected retirement eligibility by job class, as well as new hires and separations during the past five fiscal years, for employees in your department (figures do not include temporary exempt employees with as-needed schedules). In addition, we present data on staff that are currently likely to retire. In your department, we see:

- The average age is 47.7 years, equivalent to the citywide average of 47.9. The average length of service (LOS) is 12.5 years, equivalent to the citywide average of 12.7 years.
- The largest age group is 45-54 years (37.5% of employees), similar to the citywide average of 36.2% in the same age group. The distribution of employees among age groups in your department is similar to the distribution of employees citywide.
- The largest length of service (LOS) group is 5-9 years (26.2%), slightly lower than the citywide average (29.6%) in this group. Overall, the distribution of employees among the LOS groups in your department is similar to the distribution citywide.
- Between FY02 and FY06, there were 100 new hires and 100 separations in your department.
- 41.2% of your employees are currently eligible for vesting retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old and have at least 5 years of service. This is higher than the citywide average of 40.9%.
- 20.6% of your employees are currently eligible for service retirement. This means they are at least 50 years old with 20 years of service or are at least 60 years old with 10 years of service. This is similar to the citywide average of 20.9%.
- 4.0% of your employees are currently likely to retire soon because they have reached the average retirement age of 60 and have 20 years of service. This is just under the citywide average of 4.4%.

Appendix E. Sample Memo

- Overall, it appears there is high retirement risk is in the following areas:
 - Job Series X: Class A, Class B, and Class C. Of the 137 employees in these classes, 56 (or 41%) are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits, and 13 are likely to retire soon (based on the average retirement age of 60 years and having 20 years of service). In five years, 100 (or 73%) will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits, and 37 (or 27%) will be likely to retire.
 - Job Class Y. Of 29 employees in this class, 10 (or 34%) are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits, and 4 are likely to retire soon (based on the average retirement age of 60 years and having 20 years of service). In five years, 16 (or 55%) will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 9 (or 31%) will be likely to retire.
 - Job Class Z. Of 62 employees in this class, 19 (or 31%) are currently eligible for minimum retirement benefits, and 3 are likely to retire soon (based on the average retirement age of 60 years and having 20 years of service). In five years, 36 (or 58%) will be eligible for minimum retirement benefits and 7 (or 11%) will be likely to retire.

Questions

Given these data and your service area expertise, please consider how you would answer the following questions:

- How do you expect changing demographics, technology, and other factors to affect service needs in the next 3 to 10 years?
- How do you expect the skills needed to deliver your services will change in the next 3 to 10 years?
- Will your department have sufficient staff and skills to address these needs?
- If not, what positions or skills will you need?
- Are you currently experiencing high numbers of separations or low numbers of new hires?
- Do you expect a large number of separations in the next few years?
- Have you taken any steps to capture critical operational knowledge of your employees?

We would like to schedule a one-hour meeting at your office to discuss these questions. I will contact you to find a date and time. If you have any questions about our succession planning project or the attached data, please contact María Ryan at 551-8948 or Michelle Allersma at 557-4889.

Attachments:

1. Workforce Demographics & Retirement Projections
2. Employees Eligible and Likely to Elect Service Retirements

cc: Philip A. Ginsburg, Human Resources Director

Appendix F. Sample Analysis

Workforce Demographics and Retirement Projections

Average Age and Length of Service (LOS)

Department	Total EEs	Average Age	Average LOS
Sample Department	551	47.7	12.5
Citywide	23,906		
Average Age, Average LOS		47.9	12.7

Employee data are as of October 1, 2006. Source: HR Information System. Temporary exempt employees with as needed schedules excluded. Citywide figures exclude sworn members of the Police & Fire departments.

Employees by Age Groups

Department	Total	<25		25-34		35-44		45-54		55-64		65+	
		#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Sample Department	551	44	0.8%	64	11.7%	136	24.7%	207	37.5%	125	22.6%	14	2.6%
Citywide	23,906												
Percentage of EEs in Age Groups		191	0.8%	2,617	10.9%	6,169	25.8%	8,648	36.2%	5,604	23.4%	677	2.8%

Employees by Length of Service Groups

Department	Total	<5 Years		5-9 Years		10-14 Years		15-19 Years		20-24 Years		25-29 Years		30+ Years	
		#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Sample Department	551	122	22.1%	144	26.2%	77	14.0%	87	15.8%	68	12.3%	36	6.6%	17	3.0%
Citywide	23,906														
Percentage of EEs in LOS Groups		4,636	19.4%	7,129	29.8%	3,455	14.5%	3,237	13.5%	2,612	10.9%	1,863	7.8%	974	4.1%

New Hires, FY02-FY06

Title	FY02	FY03	FY04	FY05	FY06	Total
Sample Department	10	37	26	10	17	100
Citywide	1,859	1,193	978	1,172	1,534	6,736

New hires in this table refer to employees who are new to City service. They exclude hires of temporary exempt employees as well as movements of existing employees among departments through reassignments, transfers, promotions, demotions, and rehires made within a week of a prior appointment.

Separations, FY02-FY06

Title	FY02	FY03	FY04	FY05	FY06	Total
Sample Department	10	24	50	12	4	100
Citywide	1,792	1,686	1,875	2,285	1,845	9,483

Separations in this table refer to employees who leave City service. These separations can be voluntary (e.g. retirements and resignations) or involuntary (e.g. layoffs). They exclude separations of temporary exempt employees.

Appendix F. Sample Analysis

Workforce Demographics and Retirement Projections

Employees Eligible for Vesting Retirement Benefits

Department	Total	#	%
Sample Department	551	154	27.9%
Citywide	23,906		
Percentage of EEs by Milestones		9,776	40.9%

Note: assumes no turnover.

27.9% of current employees are at least 50 years of age with 5 years of service, and are therefore eligible for vesting retirement.

Employees Eligible for Minimum Service Retirement Benefits

Department	Total	Current		In 3 Years		In 5 Years		In 10 Years	
		#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Sample Department	551	154	27.9%	235	42.6%	297	53.9%	407	73.9%
Citywide	23,906								
% of Citywide EEs		4,988	20.9%	7,643	32.0%	9,822	41.1%	14,542	60.8%

Note: assumes no turnover.

20.9% of employees are currently eligible for a **service retirement**, because they are either at least 50 years of age with 20 years of service or 60 years of age with 10 years of service.

Employees Most Likely to Elect Service Retirement

Department	Total	Current		In 3 Years		In 5 Years		In 10 Years	
		#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Sample Department	551	33	6.0%	63	11.4%	93	16.9%	132	24.0%
Citywide	23,906								
% of Citywide EEs		1,049	4.4%	2,067	8.6%	2,789	11.7%	4,268	17.9%

Note: assumes no turnover.

6.0% of employees are currently estimated to be likely elect a service retirement because they have reached the average miscellaneous retirement age of 60 and have 20 or more years of service.

Appendix F. Sample Analysis

Workforce Demographics and Retirement Projections

Department X - Employees Eligible¹ & Likely² to Elect Service Retirements

Job Code	Job Title	EEs in Dept	Current				In 3 Years				In 5 Years				In 10 Years			
			Eligible		Likely		Eligible		Likely		Eligible		Likely		Eligible		Likely	
			#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
0922	Manager I	4	1	25%			1	25%			3	75%			4	100%	1	25%
0923	Manager II	3					1	33%			1	33%			3	100%		
0931	Manager III	6	1	17%			1	17%			1	17%			2	33%		
1004	IS Operator-Analyst	6	3	50%			3	50%	1	17%	3	50%	2	33%	4	67%	2	33%
1014	IS Technician-Supervisor	1																
1070	IS Project Director	6					2	33%			3	50%			5	83%		
1073	IS Director	1	1	100%			1	100%			1	100%			1	100%	1	100%
1204	Senior Personnel Clerk	9					1	11%			2	22%			3	33%		
1220	Payroll Clerk	14	7	50%	4	29%	8	57%	6	43%	8	57%	7	50%	9	64%	7	50%
1233	EEO Programs Specialist	4	1	25%			2	50%			2	50%	1	25%	2	50%	1	25%
1241	Personnel Analyst	6	2	33%			3	50%	1	17%	3	50%	1	17%	4	67%	2	33%
1244	Senior Personnel Analyst	6									1	17%			2	33%		
1270	Departmental Personnel Officer	2					2	100%			2	100%			2	100%		
1402	Junior Clerk	2									1	50%			1	50%		
1406	Senior Clerk	4	1	25%			2	50%			2	50%	1	25%	4	100%	1	25%
1408	Principal Clerk	13	2	15%			4	31%	2	15%	5	38%	2	15%	10	77%	2	15%
1424	Clerk Typist	69	10	14%	2	3%	16	23%	3	4%	26	38%	5	7%	40	58%	8	12%
1426	Senior Clerk Typist	93	26	28%	4	4%	37	40%	10	11%	43	46%	15	16%	62	67%	19	20%
1446	Secretary 2	42	7	17%	1	2%	13	31%	1	2%	22	52%	3	7%	33	79%	6	14%
1454	Executive Secretary 3	1																
1822	Administrative Analyst	90	36	40%	10	11%	52	58%	16	18%	67	74%	25	28%	81	90%	35	39%
1823	Senior Administrative Analyst	32	14	44%	3	9%	20	63%	5	16%	23	72%	10	31%	28	88%	14	44%
1824	Principal Administrative Analyst	15	6	40%			10	67%	2	13%	10	67%	2	13%	14	93%	6	40%
2708	Custodian	1	1	100%			1	100%			1	100%			1	100%		
5186	Financial Manager	1													1	100%		
5504	Project Manager 2	1													1	100%		
7334	Stationary Engineer	28	6	21%	2	7%	10	36%	2	7%	15	54%	3	11%	21	75%	4	14%
YYYY	Job Class Y	29	10	34%	4	14%	16	55%	8	28%	16	55%	9	31%	22	76%	10	34%
ZZZZ	Job Class Z	62	19	31%	3	5%	29	47%	6	10%	36	58%	7	11%	47	76%	13	21%
Totals		551	154	28%	33	6%	235	43%	63	11%	297	54%	93	17%	407	74%	132	24%

¹ Employees are *eligible* to elect a service retirement when they are 50 years of age with 20 years of service or 60 years of age with 10 years of service.

² Employees are most *likely* to retire when they reach the average retirement age of 60 years and have 20 years of service.

Appendix G. Sources

Literature Reviewed

A Review of the Fire-EMS System. 2004. Controller's Office. City & County of San Francisco. February 28.

Administrative Professionals (APEX) Homepage. City and County of Denver.
<http://www.denvergov.org/APEX/HomePage/tabid/377959/Default.aspx>

Business Outlook Survey. 2006. Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia.
<http://www.phil.frb.org/files/bos/bos1006.html> October.

CPS Human Resource Services. 2005. Building the Leadership Pipeline in Local, State & Federal Government.

Campos et al. Who Will Do San Francisco's Work? Managing Workforce Change. 2003. Department of Human Resources. City & County of San Francisco. March.

Davidson, Glen, et al. 2007. The Impact of the Aging Workforce on Public Sector Organizations and Mission. International Public Management Association for Human Resources. February.

Department of Transportation Mentoring Program. New York State Department of Civil Service.
<http://www.cs.state.ny.us/successionplanning/agyinitiatives/dotmentor.cfm>

Diversity Counts. 2007. American Library Association, Office for Research and Statistics and Office for Diversity. January.

Georgia State Government. 2005. Competency-Based Development Guide Creating a World-Class Workforce.

Georgia State Government. 2005. G-Comps Georgia's Competency Dictionary for Workforce Planning.

Hickman, Connie. 2006. Thousand Oaks Succession Planning PowerPoint Presentation. City of Thousand Oaks. October.

How to manage an ageing workforce. 2006. *The Economist*. February 18.

Human Capital: Insights for U.S. Agencies from Other Countries' Succession Planning and Management Initiatives. 2003. (GAO-03-914). Government Accountability Office.

Johnston, Gilbert L. and Judith Brown. 2004. Workforce Planning Not a Common Practice IPMA-HR Study Finds. *International Public Managers Association (IPMA) for Human Resources*. Volume 33 No. 4. Winter 2004.

McGonigle et al. 2006. Recommendations for Updating the City's Classification Plan, Interim Report. ICF Consulting. September 6.

Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2006-07 Edition. U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics.

Appendix G. Sources

Preparing the Next Generation: A Guide for Current and Future Local Government Managers. 2003. International City/County Management Association (ICMA) Edited by Frank Benest.

Purcell, Patrick J. 2000. Older Workers: Employment and Retirement Trends. *Monthly Labor Review*. U.S. Department of Labor Bureau of Labor Statistics. October.

Report of the Retiree Resources Workgroup. 2002. New York State Department of Civil Service. <http://www.cs.state.ny.us/successionplanning/workgroups/RetireeResources/retireeresources.cfm> September.

Skills Gap Report – A Survey of the American Manufacturing Workforce. 2005. National Association of Manufacturers’ Manufacturing Institute/Center for Workforce Success and Deloitte Consulting LLP. http://www.nam.org/s_nam/bin.asp?CID=89&DID=235731&DOC=FILE.PDF

Taxation & Finance Recruitment Program. New York State Department of Civil Service. <http://www.cs.state.ny.us/successionplanning/agencyinitiatives/taxrecruitment.cfm>

The Aging-and-Retiring Government Workforce: How Serious is the Challenge? What are Jurisdictions Doing About it? 2003. The Center for Organizational Research.

Toossi, Mitra. 2005. Labor force projections to 2014: retiring boomers. *Monthly Labor Review*. United States Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics. November.

U.S. Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration. O*NET Online Directory of National High Growth Industries. <http://online.onetcenter.org/find/indemand>

Van Houten, Paul, and Camille Meade. 2005 Departmental Training & Development Survey. Department of Human Resources, City & County of San Francisco. March.

Van Houten, Paul. 2001. “Critical Issues for DHR’s Training and Organizational Development Unit,” memo to Michele Modena, Deputy Director, Administrative Services, Department of Human Resources. City & County of San Francisco. July 2.

Washington State Civil Service Reform: Human Resource Systems Research Report. November 2002. Washington State, Department of Personnel.

Workforce Succession Planning and CPS Workforce Continuity Model. 2007. CPS Human Resource Services. March.

Appendix G. Sources

Interviews

We are grateful to staff in the following departments for sharing their time and insights with us:

Date	Department	Interviewee
December 13, 2006	Department of Public Health	Liz Jacobi, DPH Human Resources Director
December 18, 2006	Juvenile Probation Department	Chief William Sifferman Allison Magee, Director of Administrative Services
December 19, 2006	Police Department	Captain Mario Gonzalez Alice Villagomez, Departmental Personnel Officer
January 5, 2007	Department of Human Resources	Kerry Ko, Deputy Director Patti Martin, Departmental Personnel Officer
January 9, 2007	Telecommunications & Information Systems	John Marquez, TIS Human Resources Director
January 9, 2007	Controller's Office	Ed Harrington, Controller Todd Rydstrom, Director of Budget & Analysis Jeanine Wong, Director of Administration
January 9, 2007	Public Library	Luis Herrera, City Librarian Jill Bourne, Deputy City Librarian Donna Marion, Library Human Resources Director
January 10, 2007	Recreation & Park Department	Kin Gee, RPD Human Resources Director Dennis Kern, Director of Operations
January 10, 2007	Human Services Agency	Phil Arnold, Deputy Director of Administration Lydia Chan, Human Resources & Staff Development Director Arlene Laxamana, Succession Planning Manager

Appendix G. Sources

January 10, 2007	Adult Probation	Jeanne Woodford, Chief Adult Probation Officer Hector Ballesteros, Supervising Adult Probation Officer Diane Zagorites, DHR Client Services Representative
January 11, 2007	Municipal Transportation Agency	Diana Buchbinder, MTA Human Resources Director
January 12, 2007	Fire Department	Deputy Chief Gary Massetani Jesusa Bushong, Departmental Personnel Officer
January 12, 2007	Public Utilities Commission	Michele Modena, PUC Human Resources Director Linda Marini, Assistant Director Karen Hill, Workforce Planning & Development Manager
January 17, 2007	Board of Supervisors	Gloria L. Young, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors
April 4, 2007	Department of Human Resources	Bob Pritchard, Acting Deputy Director Paul Van Houten, Director of Training & Organizational Development
April 30, 2007	General Services Agency	Steve Nakajima, GSA Human Resources Director Nancy Chin, Training Coordinator